

Completions and Reconstructions of Musical Works

Part 2: Viennese Classics

By Stephen Barber

Gluck first wrote *Orfeo ed Eurydice* in 1762 for Vienna, in Italian, with an alto castrato in the lead role. He transposed the solo role upwards for a soprano castrato in 1769. He revised the work considerably for Paris in 1774, having the libretto translated into French, rewriting the solo role for the kind of high tenor known as a *haut-contre*, revising the orchestration and writing new recitatives and additional ballets, including some material from his own earlier works, such as the virtuoso aria *Amour, viens rendre* at the end of the first Act and the Dance of the Furies in the second. In the nineteenth century, the rise in pitch made the tenor version impractical and in 1866 Berlioz revised the whole opera, knowing both the 1762 and 1774 versions well. He rewrote the solo part for a mezzo-soprano or contralto. He also restored the key structure of the 1762 version while retaining most, though not all, of the additional material from 1774, but reverting to the 1762 orchestration where he thought it superior to the revision.¹ Given Gluck's willingness to revise his work for different occasions and to borrow freely from his other works, the aim of constructing an ideal version seems particularly appropriate for *Orfeo*. While 1762, with either a soprano or a countertenor, and 1774 with a high tenor each has its advocates, the mainstream view, with which I concur, is to go for the Berlioz version, though often this is also modified, for example by adding in the passages which he cut and translating it back into Italian. There is a chart of the three main versions, with their differences noted, in Patricia Howard's useful book on the opera. There is a discography [here](#). Front runners are, for 1762 with a soprano, Bernada Fink with René Jacobs (Harmonia Mundi), and with a countertenor, Derek Lee Ragin with John Eliot Gardiner (Philips, later Decca), for 1774 Richard Croft with Marc Minkowski (Archiv) and for the Berlioz version, somewhat modified, Anne Sofie von Otter with John Eliot Gardiner (EMI) and Jennifer Larmore with Donald Runnicles (Teldec).

Joseph Haydn wrote some insertion and concert arias, including the wonderful *Scena di Berenice* of 1795, first performed in London. Its companion, *Arianna a Naxos*, probably of 1789, was published only with keyboard accompaniment, though Haydn intended to orchestrate it. An anonymous string orchestra version was found which appears to be at least connected with Haydn. This has been edited by H. C. Robbins Landon and Christopher Hogwood and recorded by Arleen Auger with Hogwood, along with other Haydn arias including the *Scena di Berenice* (L'Oiseau Lyre, later Avie). There is also a version for full orchestra by Haydn's pupil Sigismund Neukomm, recorded by Marianne Beate Kielland with Michael Alexander Willens (Ars Production).

Haydn's last opera, *L'anima del filosofo*, on the Orpheus and Eurydice story, was commissioned for London but not performed, and was forgotten until 1950. Haydn did not quite complete it, but what he left is performable as it stands and has been recorded several times. The reigning version is by Christopher Hogwood (Decca).

¹ He also made further suggestions, not incorporated in his edition, such as replacing the overture with the Larghetto from *Don Juan* (where it immediately precedes the *Dance of the Furies*), replacing the aria *Amour, viens rendre* – which he thought spurious – with *Ô combats! ô désordre extrême* from *Écho et Narcisse* and replacing the final chorus with *Le dieu de Paphos et de Cnide*, also from *Écho et Narcisse*. These have not generally been taken up.

Haydn left his last string quartet, Op. 103 in D minor, incomplete, leaving only what would have been the two middle movements. This is how it is usually performed and recorded, but in 2013 the Haydn scholar William Drabkin found sketches for the first movement and composed the two missing movements; this has not yet been recorded.

Mozart left a large number of sketches, fragments and incomplete works which could be made performable by others. The new Complete Mozart 225 Edition (DG) has four discs of them – see [here](#). It also has some others scattered throughout the collection. I shall concentrate on a few of the most important.

The *Sinfonia Concertante for four wind instruments and orchestra* K. 297b is generally thought to be a corrupt version of a lost original, in which the solo instruments were flute, oboe, horn and bassoon, and not oboe, clarinet, horn and bassoon as in the extant work. There are numerous recordings of the extant version, but Robert Levin has made a reconstruction of the original (Philips). I have to say that, while this is a bold rescue job, too much had gone wrong before Levin worked on it.

There are three unfinished operas from Mozart's maturity. *Zaide* K. 344 (the title is not Mozart's) was to be a Singspiel rather similar to the later *Die Entführung aus dem Serail* K. 384. Mozart wrote fifteen numbers, amounting to an act and a half, and then abandoned it. The libretto is lost (it was based on a play by Voltaire). The work is performable as it stands; it was recorded by Bernhard Klee for the original Complete Mozart Edition (Philips) and is now in the new Complete Mozart 225 (DG). The one movement Symphony K. 318 is used as the overture. It is not quite first rate Mozart but well worth hearing. Other versions are by Leopold Hager (Orfeo) and Paul Goodwin (Harmonia Mundi). A more recent recording is by Ian Page (Signum), but this does not use Page's own completion, which draws on other Mozart material. Martin Haselböck's version (CPO) uses the quartet K. 479, written as an insertion for another opera, with new words, for a finale.

L'oca del Cairo K. 422 was an abortive opera buffa. Six numbers survive, some only as sketches. They were completed, orchestrated and had recitatives supplied by Erik Smith, and recorded by Peter Schreier, again for the original Complete Mozart Edition (Philips) and the new Complete Mozart 225 (DG). *Lo sposo deluso* K. 430 was a rather similar project, which got as far as four numbers. Again Erik Smith provided the orchestration and the work was recorded by Colin Davis as a companion to *L'oca del Cairo*.

The *Rondo for piano and orchestra* K. 386 was drafted as the original finale for the piano concerto in A K. 414. The manuscript was dismembered and dispersed and for a long time the work was known only from a solo piano arrangement by Cipriani Potter. Most of the missing pages were eventually discovered and the work reconstructed in 1962 by Paul Badura-Skoda and Charles Mackerras. There have been several recordings of this version, such as Brendel (Philips) and Ashkenazy (Decca) but, later, further pages turned up and a new edition was prepared by Alan Tyson in 1989. This is used in more recent recordings such Robert Levin (Decca).

Mozart left cadenzas for some of his piano concertos but not others. A number of pianists have made and recorded their own and sometimes published them for others to use. Robert Levin's grasp of Mozartean style is so secure that he actually improvises his cadenzas on the spot, as did Mozart himself (Decca). For the Concerto in D Minor K.466, for which Mozart did not leave his own cadenzas, many pianists use those by Beethoven. There is a similar issue for the violin concertos, with published ones going back to Joseph Joachim.

Mozart never completed his *C minor mass* K. 427, and the surviving materials of the *Sanctus* and *Benedictus* are fragmentary. Most recordings use a tided-up and partially reconstructed version of the fragmentary work; there are several editions. An early completion by Joseph Drechsler does not survive, and a later one by Georg Aloys Schmitt used movements from other Mozart masses. More recently Ton Koopman did something similar, using a mass by Michael Haydn. Completions by Philip Wilby and Benjamin-Gunnar Cohrs use sketches left by Mozart. None of these have yet been recorded. Rudolf Moralt filled the missing sections from Mozart's earlier *Missa longa* K. 262 (Decca). Robert Levin drew on the sketches but also on the cantata *Davide penitente* K. 469, for which Mozart reused parts of the Mass and added two movements which might have been originally intended for it. This has been recorded, conducted by Helmuth Rilling (Hänssler Classic), and I can recommend it.

The autograph of Mozart's *Clarinet Concerto* K. 622 is lost, but it is known that he originally wrote the solo part for an instrument with an extended lower range. In the surviving score, the part has been adapted to fit the normal instrument. This is what was always played until relatively recently, when players started ordering, and instrument-makers offering, instruments with the extended lower range, now known as basset clarinets, specifically to play this work, the finest ever written for the instrument. The reconstruction of the solo line is straightforward and the work gains considerably from it. The same is true, though to a lesser extent, of the *Clarinet Quintet* K. 581, though not the *Clarinet Trio* K. 498, an earlier work. The first recording of the restored versions of both the Concerto and the Quintet together was, I believe, that of Thea King (Hyperion) in 1985, since when there have been many of each work. (The basset clarinet is also required in *Così fan tutte* and *La Clemenza di Tito*.)

Mozart left his *Requiem* K. 626 incomplete at his death. His widow asked first Joseph von Eybler and then Franz Xaver Süssmayr to work on it so that she could provide a completed work to its commissioner. The extent to which they worked from instructions left by Mozart is still disputed. The Süssmayr version is the one most often recorded, and, in the absence of other information, it should be assumed that it is the one used. There is a huge number of recordings. In the last fifty years dissatisfaction with Süssmayr's work led to many scholars making new completions. There are now well over twenty of these, and you can read a summary of them [here](#). Most of them incorporate a sketch of an Amen fugue which turned up in the 1960s and may well have been intended for the work. Many have not been recorded. Of those which have, the leading ones are by Richard Maunder, who aims to eliminate Süssmayr's contribution completely, recorded by Christopher Hogwood (Decca), Franz Beyer, who aims to tidy it up, recorded by Nikolaus Harnoncourt (Deutsche Harmonia Mundi and Teldec), Leonard Bernstein (DG) and Neville Marriner (Decca – Marriner also recorded Süssmayr on Philips); Duncan Druce, who recomposes the sections contributed by Süssmayr, recorded by Roger Norrington (Virgin); and Robert Levin, who starts from Süssmayr but reworks it considerably, following a detailed study of Mozart's practice. This last has been recorded several times, for example by Donald Runnicles (Telarc), Bernard Labadie (Atma Classique), Martin Pearlman, who uses period instruments (Telarc) and Charles Mackerras (Linn). At one point it seemed as if Levin would displace Süssmayr completely, but this hasn't yet happened, though in my view it deserves to. The Stephen Cleobury recording (King's College) contains both Süssmayr complete and parts of the completions by the other main contenders.

Beethoven's increasing deafness led to miscalculations in the orchestration of some of his works. Conductors such as Wagner, Mahler and Weingartner suggested remedies for these, and they also sometimes modified brass parts where modern fully chromatic instruments can play passages impossible in Beethoven's day, such as in the recapitulation of the first movement of the fifth

symphony or the opening of the last movement of the ninth. These modifications – they are ideal versions rather than reconstructions – used to be standard practice, and you can hear them in older recordings, for example by George Szell, Karl Böhm and Herbert von Karajan. The rise of historically informed performance has led to their disuse, but they still have their value, particularly in playing the symphonies with modern orchestras.

At the time of his death Beethoven was working on a tenth symphony. The surviving sketches of the first movement were turned into a score by Barry Cooper and have been recorded by Wyn Morris (Carlton Classics) and Walter Weller (Chandos).

Beethoven made an arrangement of his violin concerto Op. 61 as a piano concerto, Op. 61a. This is little more than a curiosity, though it is occasionally recorded, for example by Daniel Barenboim (DG) and Howard Shelley (Chandos). However, for it he wrote a cadenza for the first movement, something he had not done for the violin version. This introduces the timpani repeated notes, which are a motif in the main movement. It has occasionally been adapted and reworked back for the violin. This has been done by Max Rostal, Eugène Ysaÿe, Christian Tetzlaff, Thomas Zehetmair and others. I believe Wolfgang Schneiderhan was the first to make a recording doing this, in a beautiful reading (DG).

The cycle of Beethoven's string quartets does not normally include his transcription for quartet of the piano sonata Op. 14 No. 1; some quartets who do include it are the Cuarteto Casals (Harmonia Mundi) and the Wihan Quartet (Nimbus). It is also occasionally programmed separately. It is becoming increasingly common to play the quartet Op. 130 with its original finale, the *Grosse Fuge* Op. 133, a reconstruction I support, and recordings usually contain both this and the replacement finale on the same disc. These have tended to replace the older practice of playing the *Grosse Fuge* in the version for string orchestra by Felix Weingartner, for example Otto Klemperer (EMI). Mahler's string orchestra version of the quartet Op. 95 has been recorded by Hartmut Haenchen (Berlin Classics), coupled with Mahler's version of Schubert's *Death and the Maiden* quartet (D.810). Leonard Bernstein made and recorded string orchestra versions of the quartets Op. 131 and 135 (DG). Terje Tønnesen recorded arrangements of all the late quartets (BIS). Of Beethoven's own other arrangements I shall mention only the string quintet Op. 104, his transcription of the piano trio Op. 1 No. 3, which became better known through its use in Vikram Seth's novel *An Equal Music*. The recording referred to in the book is that by the augmented Suk Quartet (Supraphon).

Beethoven's *Waldstein* piano sonata (Op. 53 in C) originally had a middle movement, which Beethoven removed and replaced by the *Introduzione* to the finale. The discarded movement was published separately as the *Andante favori* (WoO 57). This is sometimes included as an extra in recordings of the sonata, but, rightly, never in its original place.

Weingartner's orchestral version of the *Hammerklavier* sonata (Op. 106 in B flat) was regarded as instructive by Donald Tovey but has long been forgotten. Weingartner's own 1930 recording is available (Tahra or Naxos) and there is a more recent one by Kurt Graunke (Urania).

For Beethoven, the outstanding example of reconstruction is his opera *Fidelio*. The original version of 1805 was revised in 1806, when it was reduced from three acts to two, and then completely overhauled in 1814. *Fidelio* was Beethoven's original title for the work but early performances were given the title *Leonore*, to distinguish it from another work of the time. The scholar Erich Prieger painstakingly reconstructed the 1805 score in the early 1900s and retained the title *Leonore* to distinguish it from the final version. It is significantly different from the final version and, arguably, in some ways superior. At any rate it deserves to stand alongside it. There is a splendid recording of this

by Herbert Blomstedt (Berlin Classics) and more recent ones by Bertrand de Billy (Oehms) and René Jacobs (Harmonia Mundi), who both rework the dialogue. Jacobs uses period instruments. The version by John Eliot Gardiner (DG) is based on 1805 but with some revisions from 1806 and 1814; it is therefore a conflation. The original dialogue is replaced by a narration. There is also a recording of the 1806 version, by Marc Soustrot (MDG).

Schubert went through a period when he found it difficult to complete works, perhaps because his style was then developing so fast. After the sixth symphony there are fragments of two unnumbered symphonies (D. 615 and D. 708A, both in D), which have been made performable by the Schubert scholar Brian Newbould; they have been recorded by Neville Marriner, whose Schubert symphony cycle, originally on Philips, is the most comprehensive so far, including other completions and versions as noted below; also by Peter Gülke (Berlin Classics) and Charles Mackerras (Hyperion). Then there is No. 7 (D. 729 in E), which exists only as a continuous sketch. This is why most cycles of Schubert symphonies skip over this number, Marriner being an exception. It was first orchestrated by Felix Weingartner; this has been recorded by Alun Francis (CPO) and Heinz Rogner (Berlin Classics, with the Peter Gülke symphonic fragments including No. 10). More idiomatic is the version by Newbould, recorded by Marriner and also in an impressive version by Gabriel Chmura (Koch Schwann).

No. 8 (D. 759 in B minor), celebrated as the 'Unfinished,' poses a number of problems. The first two movements are complete and are all that is usually performed. Schubert started, but did not complete, orchestrating the Scherzo, but he left an almost continuous sketch of it. As for the finale, George Grove at the end of the nineteenth century was among the first to suggest that the B minor entr'acte from the incidental music to *Rosamunde* was the missing finale: it is in the right, rare, key, has an orchestra of the right size, and is in the right mood for the symphony while being rather too long for incidental music to a play. Newbould has completed the orchestration of the Scherzo and patched the gap in the trio. With the B minor entr'acte as finale this gives us a four-movement work. Since first hearing this I have never wanted to hear the standard version: why put up with a torso when you can have a complete symphony? It has been recorded by Marriner and also by Mackerras (Virgin Veritas); Stefan Gottfried's version uses a different reconstruction of the scherzo and is on period instruments (Aparté). However, more recently I have been very taken with the bolder version by Mario Venzago (Sony), who has made his own completion of the Scherzo and has also reworked the finale, beginning it with the B minor ballet music from *Rosamunde* before continuing with the entr'acte and adding a reminiscence of the opening of the symphony before the end. I find this very successful. JoAnn Falletta had previously recorded the work with the Newbould Scherzo and the Venzago finale (Naxos).

Next we should consider the *Grand Duo* (D. 812 in C) for piano four hands. Schubert wrote a great deal of piano duet music, but this work is remarkably unpianistic. Schumann was among the first to suggest that it might have been either a transcription of a lost symphony or a draft of one. The first to orchestrate it and so turn it into a symphony was the violinist and composer Joseph Joachim. This has been recorded by Claudio Abbado (DG) and Leon Botstein (Koch). There have been several other orchestrations, notably a more idiomatic one by the conductor Raymond Leppard (Koss Classics KC-221). (It is a little surprising that Marriner did not record a version.) Modern scholars think it never was, or was intended to be, a symphony, in which case these versions count as transcriptions rather than reconstructions; either way, having heard the piano duet original and both the Joachim and Leppard orchestrations, I prefer the last.

After the Great C major symphony, No. 9 (D. 849), Schubert planned another symphony, which would have been No. 10 (D. 936A in D). This was in 1828, the last year of his life, and it was his death which

prevented its completion. What he left was a piano sketch, from which Newbould made what he calls a performing version, since a good deal of it is conjectural. Peter Gülke (Berlin Classics, with the Rogner No. 7) recorded just the fragments and Antonello Manacorda (Sony) just the Andante. Marriner and Mackerras (Hyperion) both recorded Newbould's reconstruction, which is in three movements. Pierre Bartholomé made and recorded a bolder version, starting from Newbould, allowing for a more advanced idiom and using chromatic brass instruments, which were not available to Schubert, and incorporating the Scherzo D. 708A to make a four-movement work (*Ricercar in Ecco*). I prefer this to the Newbould version, which seems cautious in comparison. Luciano Berio incorporated Schubert's fragments in a work in his own idiom, called *Rendering*. This has been recorded several times, notably by Riccardo Chailly (Decca).

These Schubert symphony completions deserve to be more widely known, and it would help if the scores of the Newbould No. 7, the Venzago No. 8, the Leppard Symphony from the *Grand Duo*, and the Bartholomé No. 10 were readily available, for example in the Eulenburg series. I wonder when we shall have a Schubert symphony cycle with versions of all four.

I should also mention here the well-known orchestration of the *Wanderer* Fantasia (D. 760) as a piano concerto by Liszt, which has frequently been recorded, for example by Louis Lortie (Chandos). There is also an interesting non-concertante orchestral version by 'Joseph James' (the pseudonym of a team of two people), coupled with an orchestration of the Schumann C Major Fantasy, conducted by Orlando Jopling (Signum). Mottl's orchestration of the F minor Fantasy for piano duet (D. 940) has been recorded by Leon Botstein (Koch).

In the field of the string quartet, there are some early fragments, but noteworthy is the single movement conventionally known as the *Quartettsatz* (D. 703 in C minor). It was intended as the first movement of multi-movement quartet, but this is all that Schubert completed. He left about forty bars of a beautiful Andante; there are completions of this by Newbould, recorded by the Allegri Quartet (Naim), and by Livingston Gearhart, recorded by the Oregon string quartet (Centaur). Mahler projected a string orchestra version of the D minor string quartet *Death and the Maiden* (D. 810) in an annotated score but performed only one movement. The complete score was edited by David Matthews and Donald Mitchell and has been recorded by Roman Kofman (MDG) and Hartmut Haenchen (Berlin Classics). Victor Kissine's of the G major string quartet (D. 887) has been recorded by Gidon Kremer (ECM).

With the piano sonatas Schubert left a number of works with incomplete movements. These are No. 9 (D. 571 in F sharp minor), No. 11 (D. 613 in C), No. 12 (D.625 in F minor), and No. 15 (D. 840 in C, the *Reliquie*), numbering as in Martino Tirimo's edition. Sometimes he may have been dissatisfied but more often he had a tendency to break off at the end of the development section of sonata-form movements, regarding writing out the recapitulation as a mechanical task, which he did not return to complete. Two pianists, Paul Badura-Skoda (RCA) and Martino Tirimo (EMI), have each recorded a Schubert sonata cycle including completions by them of these unfinished movements. Badura-Skoda uses several fortepianos of the period, Tirimo a modern instrument. Tirimo also includes some drafts and fragments not included by Badura-Skoda, hence his slightly different numbering. An additional sonata (D.916B/900 in C), not included by Badura-Skoda or Tirimo, has been identified and completed by Jörg Demus and Roland Sölder and recorded by Sebastian Knauer (Berlin Classics). There are also isolated completions of some of the unfinished movements by other hands, some of which have been recorded.

Schubert wrote no orchestral songs but orchestral versions have been made by some distinguished names, including Liszt, Berlioz, Brahms, Strauss and Britten. There are useful collections by Abbado (DG) and Equilbey (Erato). There is also an orchestral version of *Winterreise* by Hans Zender, which he described as a 'composed interpretation.' It has been recorded by Christoph Prégardien (Kairos) and also by his son Julian Prégardien (Alpha).

The unfinished *Lazarus* (D. 689) is usually listed as an oratorio but was apparently planned as a sacred stage work, i.e. an opera. This was intended to have three 'acts,' of which Schubert completed the first and part of the second. It has been completed by Edison Denisov, in an idiom which starts close to Schubert and then moves into a more modern one; this has been recorded by Helmuth Rilling (Brilliant Classics).

Schubert's last opera, *Der Graf von Gleichen* (D.918), was left unfinished at his death, with sketches, in various stages of completion, for twenty-six numbers. It was completed in the 1990s by Richard Dünser, in an idiom which he described as 'Schubert heard through the compositional, tonal and listening experiences of the 20th century.' There is a recording of a live concert performance under Florian Boesch (Oehms).