

## Completions and Reconstructions of Musical Works

by Stephen Barber

### Introduction

Over the years a number of musical works have been left incomplete by their composers or have been partly or wholly lost and have been reconstructed. I have a particular interest in such works and now offer a preliminary survey of them.

A musical work in the Western classical tradition is the realization of a written score. Improvisation usually plays a very small part, and is replaced by interpretation, which means that a score may be realized in subtly different ways. The idiom in most periods involves a certain symmetry in design and the repetition, sometimes varied, sometimes not, of key parts of the work. If the score is unfinished, then a completion or reconstruction by a good scholar or composer allows us to hear at least an approximation to what the composer intended. The use of repetition as part of the overall design can make this possible, or the existence of sketches or earlier or later versions of the work, or a good understanding of the design and idiom. Without this the work may be an incomplete torso or may be unperformable. The work is not damaged by this process, since, unlike a picture, a sculpture or a building, it exists not as a unique physical object but as a score, which can be reproduced without detriment to the original and edited and performed without affecting the original version. Completions and reconstructions may be well or badly done, but they should be judged on how well they appear to complete what appears to be the original design by the composer. It is therefore highly desirable that completions and reconstructions be published, with clear indications of what has been added. This has been done, for example, by Nick Sandon in his work on the Peterhouse partbooks, by Martino Tirimo in his edition of Schubert piano sonatas, and by Deryck Cooke in his edition of Mahler's tenth symphony. If you don't like the idea or the individual realisation, you don't have to listen to it.

*Completions* are of works which the composer did not finish, for example by not continuing the composition beyond a certain point or by not turning a short score or piano score into an orchestral one. Of course, some works may have been abandoned because the ideas did not seem promising or because a commission fell through, but many worthwhile works have been left incomplete. The work required may vary from editorial tidying up to providing orchestration, filling out sketches or even supplying lost or uncomposed parts of the work. Mozart's *Requiem* calls for all these operations at different points of the score. A number of operas have recitatives supplied by different composers, for example Mozart's *La Clemenza di Tito* has recitatives by his pupil Franz Xaver Süssmayr: I shall not be considering such cases. If one or more parts of the score were originally extant but are lost, then the task is one of *reconstruction*, as in some Renaissance church music. These operations need to be distinguished from other possible rehandlings of works which I briefly consider.

Composers sometimes *revise* their works. They then usually prefer the revised version to be played and the original version discarded. However, performers and the public sometimes disagree, so, for example, the original version of Prokofiev's fourth symphony is usually preferred to his revision. Sometimes both versions continue in circulation side by side, such as the two versions of Hindemith's song cycle *Das Marienleben*. Sometimes performers make cuts, for various reasons, and these may be observed or opened out. This is particularly common in operas. (I tend to prefer the fullest possible musical version, even at the expense of dramatic cogency or economy.) Even if suppressed, early

versions can sometimes be recovered or reconstructed, the most spectacular example being Beethoven's *Fidelio* – see below.

A *conflation* is a version of a work formed by combining or drawing from more than one version left by the composer. This often happens with operas. An example is the normal stage version of Mozart's *Don Giovanni*, which combines most of both the Prague and the Vienna versions. A more complicated one is Gluck's *Orfeo*, for which Berlioz pioneered combining the Vienna and Paris versions, involving some transpositions and rearrangement. Modern performances may be of either original version or a conflation of the two; I discuss this in more detail below. Some people frown on conflations, because they do not correspond to a single score left by the composer; the counter argument is that they aim to achieve an ideal version which combines the best of what the composer left. Disapproval of conflations is a recent attitude, dating back about fifty years; before then it was normal, and not only in music: the standard text of Shakespeare's *Hamlet*, for example, is a conflation of two texts of different dates. My own view is that there is nothing wrong in principle with conflations, and the only question is how well they are done. I like the idea of ideal versions.

A *transcription* is an arrangement of a work for forces other than those in the original score. An example is Mussorgsky's *Pictures at an exhibition*, written for piano but orchestrated by Ravel or by someone else – there are several orchestral versions of this work. Composers themselves sometimes transcribe their own works for different forces: Haydn made three versions of his *Seven Last Words*. Stravinsky made a version of *The Rite of Spring* for piano duet for use in rehearsal but it has become a concert work in its own right. A transcription is of an extant original; if the original is not extant, the task becomes one of reconstruction, as we shall shortly see in the case of Bach. Earlier composers such as François Couperin often left the choice of instruments to the performers, so this then becomes an aspect of interpretation.

A *pastiche* is a work in the style of another composer, such as some of the encore pieces Fritz Kreisler wrote and pretended had been written by various minor earlier composers. Prokofiev's *Classical symphony* is supposed to be in the style of Haydn, and it does have some Haydnesque characteristics, but more Prokofievan ones. A *pasticcio* – the English equivalent is *parody*, but in this sense there is no suggestion of mockery – is a work formed by taking various different existing compositions and putting them together into a new work. Examples include Mozart's first four piano concertos, which are closely based on works by other composers to which he added orchestral parts. More recent works of this kind tend to take existing themes and rework them, such as Respighi's *Boutique Fantastique*, which uses pieces by Rossini, or Hindemith's clumsily but accurately titled *Symphonic Metamorphoses on themes by Carl Maria von Weber*. Stravinsky's *Pulcinella* purports to be a pasticcio of Pergolesi, but is far too characteristically Stravinskian to be seen as anything other than an original work – and it seems that most of the material he used was not by Pergolesi anyway.

Sometimes there is a *rediscovery* of a work which had been thought lost, such as recently of Stravinsky's *Chante funèbre* (Funeral Song) for his teacher Rimsky-Korsakov – see below. Or the work might have been forgotten or not known to exist, such as Schumann's violin concerto, which was suppressed by his widow and Brahms but surfaced in the 1930s. Minor and forgotten works by many composers occasionally turn up.

Sometimes composers add *additional parts* to works which are already complete. Haydn could not use wind instruments in his *Nelson Mass* (Missa in angustiis) because his employer had just sacked the

players, but his colleague Johann Fuchs later provided parts for them. Mozart added wind parts and made other changes to Handel's *Messiah*. Grieg added accompaniments for a second piano to four of Mozart's piano sonatas. Schumann added piano parts to Paganini's solo violin *Caprices*. There are probably many more such versions, but I shall not be exploring them here.

Religious music can be performed as it stands, or it can be set in its known or plausible context in the liturgy in the form of a *liturgical reconstruction*. For example, the fixed parts of the Mass (the Ordinary) can be surrounded by the parts specific to a particular occasion (the Proper) and sometimes also by the relevant readings and prayers. It is then not the music which is reconstructed but the context. There have been a number of recordings featuring such liturgical reconstructions, and I touch on them briefly. However, some religious works, such as the *Mass in B minor* of Bach and the *Missa Solemnis* of Beethoven, are impractical for liturgical use, while others, such as the *Requiems* of Berlioz and Verdi, are intended only for concert performance.

Some composers write incidental music for plays and films. They may then make concert suites out of some of this material, or it can be played and recorded as it stands. Such works as Mozart's incidental music to *Thamos*, Beethoven's to *Egmont*, Schubert's to *Rosamunde*, Schumann's to *Manfred* and Mendelssohn's to *A Midsummer Night's Dream* are well established in their own right. However, the work of making concert suites is sometimes done by other hands, and on occasions enthusiasts want the complete original score rather than a briefer suite. I give some examples below. Film music presents special challenges. The original performance materials may have been lost (MGM destroyed a huge quantity of them) and they sometimes have to be reconstructed from the film soundtracks or test pressings. This is a specialized field about which I know little. I shall therefore necessarily be very selective in discussing film scores. For an old but still useful survey see [here](#).

However, these terms are not sharply distinct and I shall in any case occasionally cross the boundaries, particularly in dealing with revisions, orchestrations and transcriptions. The textual history of some of these completions and reconstructions can also be very complex. I have endeavoured to provide succinct and accurate accounts but sometimes I have had to simplify and sometimes I have given links to longer discussions.

An issue I have deliberately omitted is the controversy which has surrounded some completions. Mahler's widow opposed Deryck Cooke's performing version of his tenth symphony but changed her mind when she heard a recording of it. The Elgar estate realized that some of the sketches for his third symphony had been published and would enter the public domain, so they commissioned Anthony Payne to undertake a realization of the work to forestall others.

Some completions and reconstructions have been recorded only once, while others have many recordings. Where there are many, I mention only one or two. I give record companies and also catalogue numbers when these seem needed. These are not a guarantee that the recording is currently available. It may have been deleted, reissued with a different number or by a different company, incorporated into a box set or made available only as a download or as a special pressing from ArkivMusic or Presto. EMI was taken over by Warner, which has reissued many of their recordings. Similarly, Philips has been incorporated into Universal, and many of their recordings have been reissued on Decca or DG. If I mention two different recording companies this means two different recordings; for example, Heinz Holliger has made two different recordings of reconstructed Bach oboe concertos. An internet search will usually turn up most recordings and often reviews of

them too. I try to avoid considering completions or reconstructions which have not been recorded on CD but sometimes it seems necessary.

### **Renaissance Church Music**

In the Renaissance, choral music was usually copied out into partbooks, one for each voice, rather than in the form of scores such as choral singers use now. A complete set of partbooks is needed to perform the work. In England, because of the upheaval of the Reformation, during which a good deal of Latin-texted church music was destroyed or mutilated, some of the surviving sets are incomplete.

The Baldwin partbooks were copied and originally owned by John Baldwin (1560-1615). He was a singer at St George's Chapel, Windsor, and then at the Chapel Royal. They are now in Christ Church College, Oxford. They lack the tenor partbook. Some of the pieces in the set can be found elsewhere, but around sixty are unique to this set. The composers represented include major figures such as John Taverner, Robert White, Thomas Tallis, Robert Fayrfax and John Sheppard. Various scholars have been working on restoring the missing line. David Wulstan's reconstruction of John Sheppard's *Media vita* has been recorded by the Westminster Cathedral Choir under Martin Baker (Hyperion) and by Stile antico (Harmonia Mundi). The Marian Consort under Rory McCleery have recorded a collection titled *Loquebantur* (Delphian). Contrapunctus under Owen Rees is working systematically through the collection, and two discs have so far been issued: *In the midst of life* and *Virgin and child* (Signum).

The Peterhouse books date from the sixteenth and seventeenth century, for a time kept in Peterhouse College, Cambridge, and now in the Cambridge University Library. There is both a Henrician collection, which dates from 1539-41, so after the English Reformation, and a larger Caroline collection, which dates to between 1625 and 1640. The Henrician collection was originally in five parts but now lacks the tenor and part of the triplex books. The Caroline collection was originally in nineteen books but now lacks four of them. They contain music by Robert Fayrfax, Nicholas Ludford, John Taverner, Christopher Tye and Thomas Tallis and also by numerous lesser composers, some represented by just one work. The scholar Nick Sandon has been working on restoring them for years and has published his work (see [here](#)). Using this, Blue Heron under Scott Metcalfe have issued five discs of music from this collection on their own label, under the title *The lost music of Canterbury*. This includes works by Hugh Aston, Nicholas Ludford and John Mason, and the complete surviving works of Hugh Sturmy, Robert Hunt and Robert Jones. Another collection is *Our Lady: music from the Peterhouse partbooks*, from the Byrd Ensemble under Markdavin Obenza (Scribe).

Another project of this kind is to restore the Sadler partbooks, collected by the clergyman John Sadler (1531-c.1591/2) and now in the Bodleian Library, Oxford. Composers represented include Thomas Tallis and William Byrd, as well as earlier composers such as Robert Fayrfax. They are almost complete but are in very poor condition because of the use of acidic ink which has damaged the pages. They require digital restoration. Stile antico have given concerts of some of the restored music but have yet to release a recording of it.

A slightly later composer in a similar position is Martin Peerson. His Latin motets survive in a single copy, one of whose parts is missing. This has been reconstructed by Richard Rastall and the collection recorded by Ex Cathedra conducted by Jeffrey Skidmore (Hyperion).

In continental Europe the outstanding figure where reconstruction is needed is Carlo Gesualdo. Of his two books of *Sacrae Cantiones*, the second lacks two of its six parts. The first person to attempt a

reconstruction was none other than Stravinsky, who worked over three of the motets as *Tres Sacrae Cantiones*. He did not aim at musicologically correct solutions and you can at moments hear his own personality peeping through. These have been recorded by James Wood (Hyperion) and Duncan Ferguson (Delphian). James Wood also achieved a scholarly reconstruction, recorded by him with Vocalconsort Berlin (Harmonia Mundi). Stravinsky's *Monumentum pro Gesualdo* is an arrangement for chamber orchestra of three of his madrigals; it involves some recomposition but no actual completion. There are recordings by Dennis Russell Davies (ECM) and Philippe Herreweghe (Pentatone). Stravinsky himself recorded both works derived from Gesualdo (Sony).

I want to register my admiration for the scholars and performers who have managed to supply the missing parts of these works. Anyone who cares for this repertoire should explore them.

Liturgical reconstructions of music from this period include James O'Donnell's amplification of Orlande de Lassus' *Missa Bell'Amfitrit'altera* with other music of the time (Hyperion) and Paul McCreesh's of Tomás Luis de Victoria's *Requiem* (DG).

### The Baroque Period

Monteverdi's *1610 Vespers* can be performed as it stands, or other works can be added to form a liturgical reconstruction. There have been several of these, including Andrew Parrott (Virgin Veritas), Jordi Savall (Astrée) and Paul McCreesh (DG). Other liturgical reconstructions, using music by Monteverdi and others of the time, include *Mass of Thanksgiving* by Andrew Parrott (EMI) and *1612 Italian Vespers* by Robert Hollingworth (Decca). Paul McCreesh has specialized in this kind of work, and he has also recorded *Venetian Vespers* (DG), *A Venetian Coronation 1595* (Virgin and Signum) and *A Venetian Christmas* (DG).

A number of Monteverdi's operas have been lost, among them his second, *L'Arianna*, apart from one number, the celebrated *Lamento d'Arianna*, which he published in more than one version. However, the libretto survives. The contemporary composer Alexander Goehr had the idea of recomposing the opera, using the original libretto, slightly cut, and including the *Lamento*. However, this is not a work of pastiche: Goehr is an admirer of Monteverdi but also of Schoenberg and he was a pupil of Messiaen, so his *Arianna* is a twentieth-century recreation of Monteverdi (NMC).

Some of François Couperin is lost completely, such as the second and third sets of his *Leçons de Tenèbres*. In the case of his motets, three of them lack the original parts for upper strings. These have been supplied and recorded by Edward Higginbottom (Novum).

Heinrich Schütz's last work, the *Opus ultimum* also known as *Schwanengesang*, was not written with a view to performance and disappeared from sight. The core of it is a setting of the whole of Psalm 119, the longest psalm, for eight-part choir. An incomplete set of parts was found in 1900 but not edited and it was presumed lost in the Second World War before more turned up in the 1970s. Two vocal lines had to be reconstructed; this was first done in 1984 by Wolfram Steude, recorded by Philippe Herreweghe (Harmonia Mundi) and the Hilliard Ensemble (Erato). A more recent reconstruction is by Werner Breig, recorded by Hans-Christoph Rademann (Carus).

There is a mystery about J. S. Bach's third *Brandenburg Concerto* (BWV 1048). Between the two fast movements, where you would expect a slow movement, there are only two chords. Some ensembles play just these, perhaps with a cadenza-like flourish, but some think that Bach would have improvised

or interpolated a slow movement, closing with the two chords. Suitable slow movements which have been suggested are the third movement from the violin sonata BWV 1021, the second movement of the organ sonata BWV 530, and the rejected original third movement from the violin sonata BWV 1019 (which requires altering the chords). However, I have not found a recent recording which uses any of these.

Bach often reused his own works for different purposes. Sometimes several versions are extant, sometimes only one. In particular, he probably adapted instrumental pieces now lost for cantatas, which he had to produce in large numbers and which survive. Bruce Haynes had the idea of adapting some cantata movements back into instrumental ones, and assembling them into a group of six concertos, to parallel the six *Brandenburg Concertos* which we have. He also set himself the challenge of repeating Bach's orchestral combinations in his new set. He numbered them *Brandenburg Concertos 7 to 12*, and they have been recorded by Eric Milnes (Atma Classique). As there are many cantatas, there is scope for others to do something similar.

Bach's keyboard concertos are all considered to have been adapted by him from versions which were originally for violin, flute, oboe or oboe d'amore. Three of these are extant: the violin concertos in A minor (BWV 1041) and E (BWV 1042) and the double violin concerto in D minor (BWV 1043). The others can be reconstructed by extracting the solo line from the keyboard version. Many people, including myself, find these reconstructed versions better than the extant keyboard ones, particularly the violin versions of the D minor (BWV 1062) and the G minor (BWV1056), the violin and oboe version of the C minor (BWV1060) and the oboe d'amore version of the A major (BWV1055). There are now a number of discs offering reconstructed concertos in various combinations. Recent violin versions include Alina Ibragimova (Hyperion) and Isabelle Faust (Harmonia Mundi), and older versions by Monica Huggett (Gaudeamus) and Elizabeth Wallfisch (Virgin Veritas, two separate discs) should not be overlooked. There is also a useful round-up by Neville Marriner (Eloquence). For flute versions there are collections by Patrick Gallois (Naxos) and Jean-Pierre Rampal (CBS MDK) and a number of individual recordings, and for oboe Heinz Holliger (Philips and ECM), Marcel Poncele (Accent) and Christian Hommel (Naxos).

Bach was reported to have composed five settings of the Passion. Two of these are the extant *St. Matthew* and *St. John Passions*. Of the others, the *St. Luke Passion*, though written in his hand and in that of his son C. P. E. Bach, is spurious. The actual composer is not known, though some think it may have been Johann Melchior Molter. There is a recording by Wolfgang Helbich (CPO). The *St. Mark Passion* is lost, but the libretto is extant, and the work is generally thought to have reused music from the *Trauer-Ode* (BWV 198) and to have itself been drawn on in the *Christmas Oratorio* (BWV 248). There have been nearly thirty reconstructions. You can read a summary of them [here](#) and there is a fuller account [here](#). I have been very happy with the Simon Heighes version as recorded by Jörg Breiding (Rondeau). The remaining Passion may have been the early *Weimar Passion*, much of whose material Bach reused in the *St. John Passion*. There is an article about it [here](#). Alternatively, it may refer to one of three versions Bach adapted from the *St Mark Passion* usually attributed to Reinhard Keiser, which you can read about [here](#).

The *Musical Offering* contains a number of canons, written in enigmatic notations, which have to be realized by the performers or by a scholar editing the work. There are numerous recordings; a particular favourite of mine is Ensemble Sonnerie (Virgin). The six-part *Ricercar*, written for the

keyboard, has frequently been orchestrated, notably by Webern, who used his own technique of *Klangfarbenmelodie*, in which the individual lines are frequently passed from instrument to instrument. Recordings include Pierre Boulez (Sony and DG) and Christoph Poppen (ECM).

Bach left his last work, *The Art of Fugue*, unfinished. There is a motto theme which runs throughout the work, except that in the last, unfinished fugue, *Contrapunctus XIV*, it does not appear. On most recordings the performers play this as Bach left it, allowing it to break off in the middle of a phrase. This I find irritating and inartistic. Nottebohm, best remembered as the person who deciphered Beethoven's sketch books, was the first to demonstrate that the motto theme of the whole work combines with the three themes of the unfinished fugue in a way which could not possibly be accidental. There have been several completions using this. You can find a summary [here](#). The one I prefer was made by Donald Tovey in 1931 and performed by him on the piano (for the score see [here](#)), to conclude a recording of the rest of the work by the Roth string quartet (Divine Art). No recent keyboard recording has included it, as far as I know, but there is an excellent quartet arrangement by Robert Simpson which does, played by the Delme quartet (Hyperion). (I discuss Busoni's *Fantasia Contrappuntistica*, which is based on Bach's work, below.) Tovey also thought that Bach's scheme for the work included a totally invertible fugue on four subjects. He wrote one, included in his edition (Dover Books), but it does not seem to have been recorded. Nor does anyone seem to have taken up Tovey's suggestions for preludes from earlier Bach works to precede each of the fugues. We could do with a recording which does this and which also includes Tovey's completion of the unfinished fugue and his invertible quadruple fugue in both versions.

## Viennese Classics

Gluck first wrote *Orfeo ed Eurydice* in 1762 for Vienna, in Italian, with an alto castrato in the lead role. He transposed the solo role upwards for a soprano castrato in 1769. He revised the work considerably for Paris in 1774, having the libretto translated into French, rewriting the solo role for the kind of high tenor known as a *haut-contre*, revising the orchestration and writing new recitatives and additional ballets, including some material from his own earlier works, such as the virtuoso aria *Amour, viens rendre* at the end of the first Act and the Dance of the Furies in the second. In the nineteenth century, the rise in pitch made the tenor version impractical and in 1866 Berlioz revised the whole opera, knowing both the 1762 and 1774 versions well. He rewrote the solo part for a mezzo-soprano or contralto. He also restored the key structure of the 1762 version while retaining most, though not all, of the additional material from 1774, but reverting to the 1762 orchestration where he thought it superior to the revision.<sup>1</sup> Given Gluck's willingness to revise his work for different occasions and to borrow freely from his other works, the aim of constructing an ideal version seems particularly appropriate for *Orfeo*. While 1762, with either a soprano or a countertenor, and 1774 with a high tenor each has its advocates, the mainstream view, with which I concur, is to go for the Berlioz version, though often this is also modified, for example by adding in the passages which he cut and translating it back into Italian. There is a chart of the three main versions, with their differences noted, in Patricia Howard's useful book on the opera. There is a discography [here](#). Front runners are, for 1762 with a

---

<sup>1</sup> He also made further suggestions, not incorporated in his edition, such as replacing the overture with the Larghetto from *Don Juan* (where it immediately precedes the *Dance of the Furies*), replacing the aria *Amour, viens rendre* – which he thought spurious – with *Ô combats! ô désordre extrême* from *Écho et Narcisse* and replacing the final chorus with *Le dieu de Paphos et de Cnide*, also from *Écho et Narcisse*. These have not generally been taken up.



soprano, Bernada Fink with René Jacobs (Harmonia Mundi), and with a countertenor, Derek Lee Ragin with John Eliot Gardiner (Philips, later Decca), for 1774 Richard Croft with Marc Minkowski (Archiv) and for the Berlioz version, somewhat modified, Anne Sofie von Otter with John Eliot Gardiner (EMI) and Jennifer Larmore with Donald Runnicles (Teldec).

Joseph Haydn wrote some insertion and concert arias, including the wonderful *Scena di Berenice* of 1795, first performed in London. Its companion, *Arianna a Naxos*, probably of 1789, was published only with keyboard accompaniment, though Haydn intended to orchestrate it. An anonymous string orchestra version was found which appears to be at least connected with Haydn. This has been edited by H. C. Robbins Landon and Christopher Hogwood and recorded by Arleen Auger with Hogwood, along with other Haydn arias including the *Scena di Berenice* (L'Oiseau Lyre, later Avie). There is also a version for full orchestra by Haydn's pupil Sigismund Neukomm, recorded by Marianne Beate Kielland with Michael Alexander Willens (Ars Production).

Haydn's last opera, *L'anima del filosofo*, on the Orpheus and Eurydice story, was commissioned for London but not performed, and was forgotten until 1950. Haydn did not quite complete it, but what he left is performable as it stands and has been recorded several times. The reigning version is by Christopher Hogwood (Decca).

Haydn left his last string quartet, Op. 103 in D minor, incomplete, leaving only what would have been the two middle movements. This is how it is usually performed and recorded, but in 2013 the Haydn scholar William Drabkin found sketches for the first movement and composed the two missing movements; this has not yet been recorded.

Mozart left a large number of sketches, fragments and incomplete works which could be made performable by others. The new Complete Mozart 225 Edition (DG) has four discs of them – see [here](#). It also has some others scattered throughout the collection. I shall concentrate on a few of the most important.

The *Sinfonia Concertante for four wind instruments and orchestra* K. 297b is generally thought to be a corrupt version of a lost original, in which the solo instruments were flute, oboe, horn and bassoon, and not oboe, clarinet, horn and bassoon as in the extant work. There are numerous recordings of the extant version, but Robert Levin has made a reconstruction of the original (Philips). I have to say that, while this is a bold rescue job, too much had gone wrong before Levin worked on it.

There are three unfinished operas from Mozart's maturity. *Zaide* K. 344 (the title is not Mozart's) was to be a Singspiel rather similar to the later *Die Entführung aus dem Serail* K. 384. Mozart wrote fifteen numbers, amounting to an act and a half, and then abandoned it. The libretto is lost (it was based on a play by Voltaire). The work is performable as it stands; it was recorded by Bernhard Klee for the original Complete Mozart Edition (Philips) and is now in the new Complete Mozart 225 (DG). The one movement Symphony K. 318 is used as the overture. It is not quite first rate Mozart but well worth hearing. Other versions are by Leopold Hager (Orfeo) and Paul Goodwin (Harmonia Mundi). A more recent recording is by Ian Page (Signum), but this does not use Page's own completion, which draws on other Mozart material. Martin Haselböck's version (CPO) uses the quartet K. 479, written as an insertion for another opera, with new words, for a finale.



*L'oca del Cairo* K. 422 was an abortive opera buffa. Six numbers survive, some only as sketches. They were completed, orchestrated and had recitatives supplied by Erik Smith, and recorded by Peter Schreier, again for the original Complete Mozart Edition (Philips) and the new Complete Mozart 225 (DG). *Lo sposo deluso* K. 430 was a rather similar project, which got as far as four numbers. Again Erik Smith provided the orchestration and the work was recorded by Colin Davis as a companion to *L'oca del Cairo*.

The *Rondo for piano and orchestra* K. 386 was drafted as the original finale for the piano concerto in A K. 414. The manuscript was dismembered and dispersed and for a long time the work was known only from a solo piano arrangement by Cipriani Potter. Most of the missing pages were eventually discovered and the work reconstructed in 1962 by Paul Badura-Skoda and Charles Mackerras. There have been several recordings of this version, such as Brendel (Philips) and Ashkenazy (Decca) but, later, further pages turned up and a new edition was prepared by Alan Tyson in 1989. This is used in more recent recordings such Robert Levin (Decca).

Mozart left cadenzas for some of his piano concertos but not others. A number of pianists have made and recorded their own and sometimes published them for others to use. Robert Levin's grasp of Mozartean style is so secure that he actually improvises his cadenzas on the spot, as did Mozart himself (Decca). For the Concerto in D Minor K.466, for which Mozart did not leave his own cadenzas, many pianists use those by Beethoven. There is a similar issue for the violin concertos, with published ones going back to Joseph Joachim.

Mozart never completed his *C minor mass* K. 427, and the surviving materials of the *Sanctus* and *Benedictus* are fragmentary. Most recordings use a tided-up and partially reconstructed version of the fragmentary work; there are several editions. An early completion by Joseph Drechsler does not survive, and a later one by Georg Aloys Schmitt used movements from other Mozart masses. More recently Ton Koopman did something similar, using a mass by Michael Haydn. Completions by Philip Wilby and Benjamin-Gunnar Cohrs use sketches left by Mozart. None of these have yet been recorded. Rudolf Moralt filled the missing sections from Mozart's earlier *Missa longa* K. 262 (Decca). Robert Levin drew on the sketches but also on the cantata *Davide penitente* K. 469, for which Mozart reused parts of the Mass and added two movements which might have been originally intended for it. This has been recorded, conducted by Helmuth Rilling (Hänssler Classic), and I can recommend it.

The autograph of Mozart's *Clarinet Concerto* K. 622 is lost, but it is known that he originally wrote the solo part for an instrument with an extended lower range. In the surviving score, the part has been adapted to fit the normal instrument. This is what was always played until relatively recently, when players started ordering, and instrument-makers offering, instruments with the extended lower range, now known as basset clarinets, specifically to play this work, the finest ever written for the instrument. The reconstruction of the solo line is straightforward and the work gains considerably from it. The same is true, though to a lesser extent, of the *Clarinet Quintet* K. 581, though not the *Clarinet Trio* K. 498, an earlier work. The first recording of the restored versions of both the Concerto and the Quintet together was, I believe, that of Thea King (Hyperion) in 1985, since when there have been many of each work. (The basset clarinet is also required in *Così fan tutte* and *La Clemenza di Tito*.)

Mozart left his *Requiem* K. 626 incomplete at his death. His widow asked first Joseph von Eybler and then Franz Xaver Süssmayr to work on it so that she could provide a completed work to its commissioner. The extent to which they worked from instructions left by Mozart is still disputed. The

Süssmayr version is the one most often recorded, and, in the absence of other information, it should be assumed that it is the one used. There is a huge number of recordings. In the last fifty years dissatisfaction with Süssmayr's work led to many scholars making new completions. There are now well over twenty of these, and you can read a summary of them [here](#). Most of them incorporate a sketch of an Amen fugue which turned up in the 1960s and may well have been intended for the work. Many have not been recorded. Of those which have, the leading ones are by Richard Maunder, who aims to eliminate Süssmayr's contribution completely, recorded by Christopher Hogwood (Decca), Franz Beyer, who aims to tidy it up, recorded by Nikolaus Harnoncourt (Deutsche Harmonia Mundi and Teldec), Leonard Bernstein (DG) and Neville Marriner (Decca – Marriner also recorded Süssmayr on Philips); Duncan Druce, who recomposes the sections contributed by Süssmayr, recorded by Roger Norrington (Virgin); and Robert Levin, who starts from Süssmayr but reworks it considerably, following a detailed study of Mozart's practice. This last has been recorded several times, for example by Donald Runnicles (Telarc), Bernard Labadie (Atma Classique), Martin Pearlman, who uses period instruments (Telarc) and Charles Mackerras (Linn). At one point it seemed as if Levin would displace Süssmayr completely, but this hasn't yet happened, though in my view it deserves to. The Stephen Cleobury recording (King's College) contains both Süssmayr complete and parts of the completions by the other main contenders.

Beethoven's increasing deafness led to miscalculations in the orchestration of some of his works. Conductors such as Wagner, Mahler and Weingartner suggested remedies for these, and they also sometimes modified brass parts where modern fully chromatic instruments can play passages impossible in Beethoven's day, such as in the recapitulation of the first movement of the fifth symphony or the opening of the last movement of the ninth. These modifications – they are ideal versions rather than reconstructions – used to be standard practice, and you can hear them in older recordings, for example by George Szell, Karl Böhm and Herbert von Karajan. The rise of historically informed performance has led to their disuse, but they still have their value, particularly in playing the symphonies with modern orchestras.

At the time of his death Beethoven was working on a tenth symphony. The surviving sketches of the first movement were turned into a score by Barry Cooper and have been recorded by Wyn Morris (Carlton Classics) and Walter Weller (Chandos).

Beethoven made an arrangement of his violin concerto Op. 61 as a piano concerto, Op. 61a. This is little more than a curiosity, though it is occasionally recorded, for example by Daniel Barenboim (DG) and Howard Shelley (Chandos). However, for it he wrote a cadenza for the first movement, something he had not done for the violin version. This introduces the timpani repeated notes, which are a motif in the main movement. It has occasionally been adapted and reworked back for the violin. This has been done by Max Rostal, Eugène Ysaÿe, Christian Tetzlaff, Thomas Zehetmair and others. I believe Wolfgang Schneiderhan was the first to make a recording doing this, in a beautiful reading (DG).

The cycle of Beethoven's string quartets does not normally include his transcription for quartet of the piano sonata Op. 14 No. 1; some quartets who do include it are the Cuarteto Casals (Harmonia Mundi) and the Wihan Quartet (Nimbus). It is also occasionally programmed separately. It is becoming increasingly common to play the quartet Op. 130 with its original finale, the *Grosse Fuge* Op. 133, a reconstruction I support, and recordings usually contain both this and the replacement finale on the same disc. These have tended to replace the older practice of playing the *Grosse Fuge* in the version

for string orchestra by Felix Weingartner, for example Otto Klemperer (EMI). Mahler's string orchestra version of the quartet Op. 95 has been recorded by Hartmut Haenchen (Berlin Classics), coupled with Mahler's version of Schubert's *Death and the Maiden* quartet (D.810). Leonard Bernstein made and recorded string orchestra versions of the quartets Op. 131 and 135 (DG). Terje Tønnesen recorded arrangements of all the late quartets (BIS). Of Beethoven's own other arrangements I shall mention only the string quintet Op. 104, his transcription of the piano trio Op. 1 No. 3, which became better known through its use in Vikram Seth's novel *An Equal Music*. The recording referred to in the book is that by the augmented Suk Quartet (Supraphon).

Beethoven's *Waldstein* piano sonata (Op. 53 in C) originally had a middle movement, which Beethoven removed and replaced by the *Introduzione* to the finale. The discarded movement was published separately as the *Andante favori* (WoO 57). This is sometimes included as an extra in recordings of the sonata, but, rightly, never in its original place.

Weingartner's orchestral version of the *Hammerklavier* sonata (Op. 106 in B flat) was regarded as instructive by Donald Tovey but has long been forgotten. Weingartner's own 1930 recording is available (Tahra or Naxos) and there is a more recent one by Kurt Graunke (Urania).

For Beethoven, the outstanding example of reconstruction is his opera *Fidelio*. The original version of 1805 was revised in 1806, when it was reduced from three acts to two, and then completely overhauled in 1814. *Fidelio* was Beethoven's original title for the work but early performances were given the title *Leonore*, to distinguish it from another work of the time. The scholar Erich Prieger painstakingly reconstructed the 1805 score in the early 1900s and retained the title *Leonore* to distinguish it from the final version. It is significantly different from the final version and, arguably, in some ways superior. At any rate it deserves to stand alongside it. There is a splendid recording of this by Herbert Blomstedt (Berlin Classics) and more recent ones by Bertrand de Billy (Oehms) and René Jacobs (Harmonia Mundi), who both rework the dialogue. Jacobs uses period instruments. The version by John Eliot Gardiner (DG) is based on 1805 but with some revisions from 1806 and 1814; it is therefore a conflation. The original dialogue is replaced by a narration. There is also a recording of the 1806 version, by Marc Soustrot (MDG).

Schubert went through a period when he found it difficult to complete works, perhaps because his style was then developing so fast. After the sixth symphony there are fragments of two unnumbered symphonies (D. 615 and D. 708A, both in D), which have been made performable by the Schubert scholar Brian Newbould; they have been recorded by Neville Marriner, whose Schubert symphony cycle, originally on Philips, is the most comprehensive so far, including other completions and versions as noted below; also by Peter Gülke (Berlin Classics) and Charles Mackerras (Hyperion). Then there is No. 7 (D. 729 in E), which exists only as a continuous sketch. This is why most cycles of Schubert symphonies skip over this number, Marriner being an exception. It was first orchestrated by Felix Weingartner; this has been recorded by Alun Francis (CPO) and Heinz Rogner (Berlin Classics, with the Peter Gülke symphonic fragments including No. 10). More idiomatic is the version by Newbould, recorded by Marriner and also in an impressive version by Gabriel Chmura (Koch Schwann).

No. 8 (D. 759 in B minor), celebrated as the 'Unfinished,' poses a number of problems. The first two movements are complete and are all that is usually performed. Schubert started, but did not complete, orchestrating the Scherzo, but he left an almost continuous sketch of it. As for the finale, George Grove at the end of the nineteenth century was among the first to suggest that the B minor entr'acte from

the incidental music to *Rosamunde* was the missing finale: it is in the right, rare, key, has an orchestra of the right size, and is in the right mood for the symphony while being rather too long for incidental music to a play. Newbould has completed the orchestration of the Scherzo and patched the gap in the trio. With the B minor entr'acte as finale this gives us a four-movement work. Since first hearing this I have never wanted to hear the standard version: why put up with a torso when you can have a complete symphony? It has been recorded by Marriner and also by Mackerras (Virgin Veritas); Stefan Gottfried's version uses a different reconstruction of the scherzo and is on period instruments (Aparté). However, more recently I have been very taken with the bolder version by Mario Venzago (Sony), who has made his own completion of the Scherzo and has also reworked the finale, beginning it with the B minor ballet music from *Rosamunde* before continuing with the entr'acte and adding a reminiscence of the opening of the symphony before the end. I find this very successful. JoAnn Falletta had previously recorded the work with the Newbould Scherzo and the Venzago finale (Naxos).

Next we should consider the *Grand Duo* (D. 812 in C) for piano four hands. Schubert wrote a great deal of piano duet music, but this work is remarkably unpianistic. Schumann was among the first to suggest that it might have been either a transcription of a lost symphony or a draft of one. The first to orchestrate it and so turn it into a symphony was the violinist and composer Joseph Joachim. This has been recorded by Claudio Abbado (DG) and Leon Botstein (Koch). There have been several other orchestrations, notably a more idiomatic one by the conductor Raymond Leppard (Koss Classics KC-221). (It is a little surprising that Marriner did not record a version.) Modern scholars think it never was, or was intended to be, a symphony, in which case these versions count as transcriptions rather than reconstructions; either way, having heard the piano duet original and both the Joachim and Leppard orchestrations, I prefer the last.

After the Great C major symphony, No. 9 (D. 849), Schubert planned another symphony, which would have been No. 10 (D. 936A in D). This was in 1828, the last year of his life, and it was his death which prevented its completion. What he left was a piano sketch, from which Newbould made what he calls a performing version, since a good deal of it is conjectural. Peter Gülke (Berlin Classics, with the Rogner No. 7) recorded just the fragments and Antonello Manacorda (Sony) just the Andante. Marriner and Mackerras (Hyperion) both recorded Newbould's reconstruction, which is in three movements. Pierre Bartholomée made and recorded a bolder version, starting from Newbould, allowing for a more advanced idiom and using chromatic brass instruments, which were not available to Schubert, and incorporating the Scherzo D. 708A to make a four-movement work (*Ricercar in Ecco*). I prefer this to the Newbould version, which seems cautious in comparison. Luciano Berio incorporated Schubert's fragments in a work in his own idiom, called *Rendering*. This has been recorded several times, notably by Riccardo Chailly (Decca).

These Schubert symphony completions deserve to be more widely known, and it would help if the scores of the Newbould No. 7, the Venzago No. 8, the Leppard Symphony from the *Grand Duo*, and the Bartholomée No. 10 were readily available, for example in the Eulenburg series. I wonder when we shall have a Schubert symphony cycle with versions of all four.

I should also mention here the well-known orchestration of the *Wanderer* Fantasia (D. 760) as a piano concerto by Liszt, which has frequently been recorded, for example by Louis Lortie (Chandos). There is also an interesting non-concertante orchestral version by 'Joseph James' (the pseudonym of a team of two people), coupled with an orchestration of the Schumann C Major Fantasy, conducted by

Orlando Jopling (Signum). Mottl's orchestration of the F minor Fantasy for piano duet (D. 940) has been recorded by Leon Botstein (Koch).

In the field of the string quartet, there are some early fragments, but noteworthy is the single movement conventionally known as the *Quartettsatz* (D. 703 in C minor). It was intended as the first movement of multi-movement quartet, but this is all that Schubert completed. He left about forty bars of a beautiful Andante; there are completions of this by Newbould, recorded by the Allegri Quartet (Naim), and by Livingston Gearhart, recorded by the Oregon string quartet (Centaur). Mahler projected a string orchestra version of the D minor string quartet *Death and the Maiden* (D. 810) in an annotated score but performed only one movement. The complete score was edited by David Matthews and Donald Mitchell and has been recorded by Roman Kofman (MDG) and Hartmut Haenchen (Berlin Classics). Victor Kissine's of the G major string quartet (D. 887) has been recorded by Gidon Kremer (ECM).

With the piano sonatas Schubert left a number of works with incomplete movements. These are No. 9 (D. 571 in F sharp minor), No. 11 (D. 613 in C), No. 12 (D.625 in F minor), and No. 15 (D. 840 in C, the *Reliquie*), numbering as in Martino Tirimo's edition. Sometimes he may have been dissatisfied but more often he had a tendency to break off at the end of the development section of sonata-form movements, regarding writing out the recapitulation as a mechanical task, which he did not return to complete. Two pianists, Paul Badura-Skoda (RCA) and Martino Tirimo (EMI), have each recorded a Schubert sonata cycle including completions by them of these unfinished movements. Badura-Skoda uses several fortepianos of the period, Tirimo a modern instrument. Tirimo also includes some drafts and fragments not included by Badura-Skoda, hence his slightly different numbering. An additional sonata (D.916B/900 in C), not included by Badura-Skoda or Tirimo, has been identified and completed by Jörg Demus and Roland Sölder and recorded by Sebastian Knauer (Berlin Classics). There are also isolated completions of some of the unfinished movements by other hands, some of which have been recorded.

Schubert wrote no orchestral songs but orchestral versions have been made by some distinguished names, including Liszt, Berlioz, Brahms, Strauss and Britten. There are useful collections by Abbado (DG) and Equilbey (Erato). There is also an orchestral version of *Winterreise* by Hans Zender, which he described as a 'composed interpretation.' It has been recorded by Christoph Prégardien (Kairos) and also by his son Julian Prégardien (Alpha).

The unfinished *Lazarus* (D. 689) is usually listed as an oratorio but was apparently planned as a sacred stage work, i.e. an opera. This was intended to have three 'acts,' of which Schubert completed the first and part of the second. It has been completed by Edison Denisov, in an idiom which starts close to Schubert and then moves into a more modern one; this has been recorded by Helmuth Rilling (Brilliant Classics).

Schubert's last opera, *Der Graf von Gleichen* (D.918), was left unfinished at his death, with sketches, in various stages of completion, for twenty-six numbers. It was completed in the 1990s by Richard Dünser, in an idiom which he described as 'Schubert heard through the compositional, tonal and listening experiences of the 20th century.' There is a recording of a live concert performance under Florian Boesch (Oehms).

## Romantic Period

Around the time he was working on *Euryanthe*, Weber also worked on another opera, to be called *Die drei Pintos*. He left a number of drafts and sketches, some in code. After various abortive attempts to have it completed, the task was taken on by the young Gustav Mahler, who deciphered the code, realized the sketches and wrote several numbers of his own to complete the opera, using Weber's themes. Although Mahler was a professional opera-house conductor, he never composed an opera of his own, so this has an interest of its own. It has been recorded with a starry cast by Gary Bertini (RCA) and also by Paolo Arrivabeni (Naxos).

Schumann's orchestration, at any rate in his later symphonies, has often been criticized for excessive doublings and heaviness. Many conductors prefer the original to the revised version of the fourth symphony for this reason. Some conductors of the symphonies, such as George Szell and Daniel Barenboim, adjust the dynamics and occasionally lighten the texture without anyone objecting. These changes are similar to those mentioned for Beethoven's symphonies. Mahler was particularly proud of his adjustments to Schumann's scoring, to the point of wanting his scores printed. Only some of them affect the orchestration; many are adjustments of dynamics. Carlo Maria Giulini recorded the third symphony, the *Rhenish*, in Mahler's version (EMI and DG). The whole cycle in Mahler's versions has been recorded by Aldo Ceccato (BIS) and Riccardo Chailly (Decca).

Shostakovich reorchestrated Schumann's cello concerto, also replacing the cello with the violin as the solo instrument. This has been recorded by Gidon Kremer (DG) and Alexander Ivashkin (Chandos).

Liszt was not only enormously prolific, he was also a compulsive reviser, so many of his works exist in more than one version. He was a good judge of his work, and the final versions are generally the best, but the earlier versions can have an interest of their own. Whether they count as rediscoveries, completions or reconstructions depends on the amount of editorial work involved. For the piano music, Leslie Howard's complete survey provides nearly every version of every work, and the booklets accompanying the series are a mine of information about revisions and reconstructions. These are all available online (Hyperion). The rival series from different hands on Naxos is also comprehensive. I can therefore be very selective.

The earlier versions of the *Paganini* and *Transcendental Studies* and the *Années de pèlerinage* are fairly well known and occasionally recorded. Not so the first cycle of *Harmonies poétiques et religieuses*, which Howard has identified, deciphered and recorded (split between CDA66421/2 and CDA67187).

Of the four *Mephisto Waltzes*, the first exists in several versions: for orchestra, piano duet and solo piano. The first two, but not the third, have two alternative endings. The louder one is the one usually played, but the softer one is the more poetic. Liszt did not provide this alternative ending in his solo piano version. Howard has done so; it has been published (Edition Peters) but is not included in his Hyperion series. (Busoni's transcription from the orchestral version is occasionally recorded, for example by Holger Groschop (Capriccio).) Liszt's piano version of its companion piece, *Der nächtliche Zug*, was long attributed to a pupil and forgotten. Howard rescued it and included it among his recordings (CDA67015). The second *Mephisto Waltz* also exists in both orchestral and piano versions. The third is a solo piano work only, but Gordon Jacob orchestrated it for the ballet *Apparitions*, conducted by Barry Wordsworth (Dutton). The fourth is also only a solo piano work; Liszt left it unfinished, and this is how it is usually recorded, but Howard completed it for his Liszt series

(CDA66201). It has not yet been orchestrated. (An orchestral set of all four, with *Der nächtliche Zug* as well, would be very welcome.)

But perhaps the star exhibit in reconstructing Liszt is the unfinished opera *Sardanapolo*, a mature work of which the composer drafted the first act. It was only in 2017 that David Trippett edited the manuscript and made a performing version. It has now been recorded by Kirill Karabits (Audite) and proves to be very much in the spirit of Verdi.

Berlioz wrote his first opera, *Benvenuto Cellini*, for the Paris opera, but even before the ill-fated premiere, he ran into trouble. The first version, known now as Paris 1, had to be cut and altered, both because of its difficulty and to please the censors. The version which was actually performed is known as Paris 2. This was a failure, and the opera was not revived until Liszt presented it at Weimar. For this, Berlioz made further cuts and some revisions. This became, by default, the standard version, until the Paris score was examined and published. In modern times all three versions have been recorded: Paris 1 (with some later additions) by John Nelson (Virgin Classics), Paris 2 by Colin Davis twice (Philips and LSO Live), and Weimar by Roger Norrington (Hänssler Classic).

His masterpiece, *Les Troyens*, also ran into trouble and was not performed complete until modern times. Happily, there are now several recordings. However, in the original version Berlioz wrote a scene in which the Greek spy Sinon gives Priam and the Trojans a lying account of the purpose of the wooden horse. In the hope of a production, Berlioz tore this out of the score, leaving only the opening. However, it had already been included in the vocal score, and so Hugh Macdonald was able to reconstruct the orchestration. As it was part of the original conception, in my view it should be included. However, the Charles Dutoit recording (Decca) is, so far, the only one to do so. The John Eliot Gardiner recording on DVD (Opus Arte) is the only one to include the saxhorns Berlioz scored for, and not replace them with modern instruments.

Italian opera is not my field, but there are two works I must mention. First is Verdi's *Don Carlos*. This was subjected to extensive cuts and revisions, starting before the first performance in Paris in 1867. The main distinction is between the revised and shorter 1884 version in four acts (the Milan version) and the longer 1886 version in five acts (the Modena version). Then there is the issue of whether to perform the work in the original French or in Italian translation, which Verdi sanctioned. Andrew Porter was the first to examine the score in Paris and to restore parts that had never been performed. The recording by John Matheson (Opera Rara) was the first to include his discoveries; the first absolutely complete stage production in French was conducted by Bertrand de Billy (Orfeo DVD). Otherwise, I refer readers to the comprehensive surveys by Ralph Moore [here](#) and Mark Pullinger [here](#). Both agree that the best choice is the 1961 Modena version in Italian by Gabriele Santini (DG).

The other Italian opera is Puccini's *Turandot*, his last work and left unfinished at his death, though he left sketches for the final scene. Franco Alfano completed it in a version known as Alfano 1, but considerably revised his completion, Alfano 2, and this is what is usually performed, though with a cut. There is a studio recording of Alfano 1 on a recital disc, *Opera Finales*, by Josephine Barstow conducted by John Mauceri (Decca) and a live one as a bonus to Alfano's *Risurrezione* under Elio Compagni (SRO). More recently the composer Luciano Berio made a new completion which some prefer; this has been recorded on DVD by Riccardo Chailly (Decca) and Valery's Gergiev (TDK); you can get Berio's completion on CD by itself in *Puccini discoveries* conducted by Chailly (Decca).



Wagner repeatedly revised *Der fliegende Holländer* without ever being finally satisfied. He originally imagined it in one long continuous act, but he later cut it, rather roughly, into three. And he revised the music of the ending, which in the original is rather trite, in his maturest style, giving us the 'redemption' ending which is nowadays usually used; he first used this ending in the revised overture. The consensus view is for the one act structure and the redemption ending, and most recordings, such as those by Georg Solti (Decca) and Giuseppe Sinopoli (DG) follow this. There is a recording of the original 1843 version by Marcd Minkowski (Naïve). Wolfgang Sawallisch (Philips) and Andris Nelsons (Royal Concertgebouw Orchestra) recorded the three-act version, Sawallisch using the original ending.

*Tannhäuser* also has a complicated history. The original version of 1843 was several times revised before the 1847 Dresden version, which became standard and was widely performed. The greatly revised Paris version of 1860 included a new Bacchanale in the Venusberg scene and sundry other changes. This version was finalized in 1867. Of modern recordings, Bernard Haitink (EMI) provides the final Dresden version, Georg Solti (Decca) the Paris version, and Wolfgang Sawallisch (Philips) and Daniel Barenboim (Teldec) each make a conflation of the two.

*Tristan und Isolde* brings a different set of issues. The *Prelude*, as Wagner wrote it, runs straight into the first act and has no ending of its own. In order to perform it in concert, the conductor Hans von Bülow, encouraged by Wagner, wrote a short conclusion to it. Wagner was dissatisfied by this and later composed his own concert ending, drawing on the closing music of the opera, which had not yet been composed when von Bülow made his ending. This then is a completion by the original composer. This concert ending is curiously little known; the score was hard to find (it is now published by W. W. Norton) and few conductors play it. Fortunately, there is a fine version by Adrian Boult (HMV 7 67645 2). Wagner also devised a concert ending, along similar lines, for the love duet from the second Act as a separate number. This was long lost but finally surfaced in the 1950s. The first recording was by Antonio Pappano with Plácido Domingo and Deborah Voigt (EMI). The popular custom of linking the Prelude with the *Liebestod*, i.e. the closing scene without the vocal part, was also Wagner's idea. The *Liebestod* is also sometimes performed on its own, with a singer. It really needs a concert beginning. In his piano transcription Liszt provided one, using music from the second Act. Tovey suggested using this in the orchestral version, but I am not aware of anyone having done so. The *Wesendonck Lieder*, which have links with *Tristan*, were written by Wagner for voice and piano. He orchestrated one (*Träume*) himself; Felix Mottl orchestrated the others, so completing the set in an orchestral version. Mottl's version is the standard one, frequently recorded; I can recommend Julia Varady (Orfeo) and Janet Baker (EMI). Of others, Henze's chamber orchestration has been well received; it has been recorded by Marjana Lipovsek with Wolfgang Sawallisch (EMI) and by Jard van Nes with Richard Hickox (Chandos).

Brahms originally wrote his piano quintet Op. 34 as a string quintet with two cellos. He then transcribed it for two pianos, and destroyed the original. He then transcribed it again for piano quintet but this time he did not destroy the two piano version. The original quintet version has been reconstructed by Anssi Karttunen and recorded by the augmented Zebra Trio (Toccata Classics). There are also numerous transcriptions of Brahms's works for different forces, such as the orchestration by Schoenberg of the G minor piano quartet Op. 25 (several versions including Christoph Eschenbach (RCA) and Simon Rattle (EMI)), by Kenneth Woods of the A major one Op. 26 (Nimbus), by Berio of the F minor Clarinet Sonata Op. 120 No. 1 conducted by Riccardo Chailly (Decca), of the *Four Serious Songs* Op. 121 by both Erich Leinsdorf (RCA) and Detlev Glanert (Ondine), a surprisingly effective one by the

pianist Dejan Lazić of the violin concerto Op. 77 as a piano concerto (Channel Classics), by Edmund Rubbra of the Handel Variations Op. 24 conducted by Neeme Järvi (Chandos) and versions of the *Hungarian Dances* for various combinations by Brahms himself and others.

Bruckner was an inveterate reviser of his own works and most Bruckner-lovers – I am one of them – have strong views about which versions they prefer. The situation is complicated by different approaches to editing. Robert Haas, who edited most of the symphonies during the 1930s and 1940s, aimed to free Bruckner's scores from the suggestions of conductors, which he considered were imposed on the composer, and to produce an ideal version of each work. In the second and eighth symphonies this involved conflating different versions, and also, in the case of the eighth, opening cuts and drawing on a sketch. After the war he was removed, because of his Nazi sympathies, and these also cast a cloud over his editorial work. Leopold Nowak made new editions, each based on the actual scores and instructions Bruckner had left, and abandoning the idea of ideal versions. Nevertheless, many conductors and Bruckner-lovers prefer the Haas scores, particularly in the eighth symphony; these include Herbert von Karajan, Bernard Haitink and Günter Wand. For the different versions of the symphonies in general see [here](#) and [here](#); for the eighth symphony specifically see [here](#). An even more complex case is the third symphony, which exists in at least four main versions; see [here](#). William Carragan is about to publish a book detailing all the versions of all the symphonies. Recordings should state, but often don't, which edition they are using. New editions of Bruckner's works are in hand and ideas change; for example, Carragan has made new editions of the first three symphonies, recorded by Gerd Schaller (Profil 12022), and the 1888 version of the fourth symphony, initially rejected by both Haas and Nowak, has been rehabilitated by Benjamin Korstvedt and recorded by Osmo Vänskä (BIS) and also see [here](#). Gerd Schaller is in the process of recording all the symphonies in all the principal versions in his Bruckner 2024 programme. I would not be surprised if, in the next turn of the wheel, the idea of constructing ideal versions did not return.

The case of Bruckner's ninth symphony is rather different. At the time of his death he had completed the first three movements, whose text is, for Bruckner, relatively stable. For the finale he left a series of sketches, though there are gaps because some sheets were taken away as souvenirs. In any case they did not extend to the coda. He certainly planned to complete the symphony and not leave it as a torso. There have now been several completions of the finale. Three are of particular importance. All are based closely on Bruckner's surviving sketches. William Carragan was the first, and his completion has been revised four times. His latest version was recorded by Gerd Schaller (Profil Medien PH11028 – do not confuse this with Schaller's own completion). Next came a group of four people, starting with Nicola Samale and Giuseppe Mazzuca, whose work was later taken over by John A. Phillips and Benjamin-Gunnar Cohrs. This is generally referred to as the SPCM version. It has also been revised several times, with the final revision recorded by Simon Rattle (Warner). Then there is the conductor Gerd Schaller, who, after recording Carragan's completion made his own, and has also revised his work. There are also others and most of them have been recorded, though sometimes by obscure orchestras and conductors. Details are available [here](#). There is a consideration and ranking of all the available completions [here](#). So far, I have been most convinced by Schaller's revised version (Profil Medien PH18030). The scores of that and of the final SPCM version have been published.

Bruckner's string quintet, his only mature chamber work, is beautiful but occasionally seems to call for orchestral forces. The Adagio was transcribed by Oeser for string orchestra, and has occasionally been recorded, for example by Herbert Blomstedt (Decca) and Vladimir Ashkenazy (Ondine).

Transcriptions of the whole work for string orchestra have been made by Hans Stadlmair, conducted by Ruben Gazarian (Bayer), and by Michael Erxleben (Cugate). Gerd Schaller transcribed it for full orchestra, i.e. with wind and brass as well as strings, and included both the original Scherzo and the Intermezzo which replaced it in the quintet version (Profil).

With Mahler there are issues at the opposite ends of his life. The first version of his early cantata *Das klagende Lied* was completed in 1880, and was in three parts: *Waldmärchen*, *Der Spielmann* and *Hochzeitsstück*. Mahler revised it in 1893 and again in 1899. In this final version he discarded the first part, reduced the number of solo singers and reduced the size of the off-stage band. This two-part version was the one regularly performed before the original score came to light in 1969. Conductors now sometimes play only the revised version (e.g. Bernard Haitink, Pierre Boulez on DG) and sometimes they prefix the first part to the revised second and third parts (e.g. Pierre Boulez on Sony, Simon Rattle, Riccardo Chailly and Cornelius Meister). The first recording of the complete 1880 original version is by Kent Nagano (Erato).

Mahler's orchestral songs were originally written with piano accompaniment before he orchestrated them. This has suggested the idea of orchestrating some of his other songs. The versions by Luciano Berio have been recorded by Thomas Hampson (Teldec), Andreas Schmidt (RCA) and Matthias Goerne (Harmonia Mundi). Those by Harold Byrns have been recorded by Bernd Weikl (DG).

Mahler's first symphony was first performed in 1889 in a version which has survived only in part. For the second version, of 1893, he equipped it with a title, *Titan*, and a programme. Both of these versions included an extra movement, *Blumine*, as the second movement. For the final version, of 1896, Mahler deleted the title, the programme and *Blumine*, and revised the orchestration of the rest. *Blumine* was lost for many years and only reappeared in 1968. Some conductors add *Blumine* to recordings of the final version, either as an extra (so Hannu Lintu on Ondine), or as a conflated version with *Blumine* in its original place (so Vladimir Jurowski on LPO). Recordings of the complete 1893 version include Jan Willem de Vriend (Challenge Classics) and Thomas Hengelbrock (Sony); more recently, François-Xavier Roth (Harmonia Mundi) has recorded 1893 on period instruments.

Before we reach Mahler's final symphony there are two issues concerning the sixth symphony. There seems no certainty about the correct order of the middle two movements as it seems that Mahler changed his mind twice. My preference is Scherzo-Andante. Then there is the issue of the hammerblows in the finale. Mahler originally wrote three of these, but in revision deleted the third. Some people think he did this for superstitious rather than musical reasons and would like it restored, preferably along with its surrounding orchestration; I am one of them. Not many conductors do this: those who do include Leonard Bernstein (both Sony and DG), Charles Mackerras (BBC Music Magazine MM251), Jukka-Pekka Saraste (Simax) and Benjamin Zander (three versions: Carlton Classics, Telarc and Brattle Media).

Mahler completed a sketch of his tenth symphony but did not live to complete the orchestration or to revise the work as was his custom. Even the orchestration of the first movement is not as full he would normally have left it. Ernst Krenek made the first performing score of the first and third movements, with the help of Franz Schalk and Zemlinsky, and these were occasionally performed on their own. It is now well known how Deryck Cooke came to make what he always called a performing version of the sketch, and not a completion of the symphony, though for many people this is a distinction without a difference. Cooke's own account of how he did his work is available (Testament) and there are at

least ten recordings, among which Simon Rattle's second, with the Berlin Philharmonic (Warner), is probably the best known. The Cooke version is the most widely performed but there are several others; a chart of all of them and their recordings is available [here](#). Of these I have heard the Rudolf Barshai version (Brilliant Classics), more a completion of the symphony than, as with Cooke, a performing version of the sketch, but for me a valid alternative to Cooke. The success of the Cooke version led to completions of other unfinished symphonies, notably the Bruckner ninth, discussed above, and the Elgar third and Moeran second, for which see below.

### French school

I have already considered Berlioz. Of the Franck school the first to be considered is Ernest Chausson. When he died in a bicycle accident he left his string quartet unfinished, having completed two movements and most of a scherzo. As there was no material for a finale, Vincent d'Indy completed the scherzo, bringing the work to an end in its home key. There are several recordings, including the Doric quartet (Chandos), the Quatuor Via Nova (Apex) and the Chilingirian quartet (Hyperion).

Charles Bordes was a Franck disciple who never completed his intended *magnum opus*, an opera to be called *Les Trois Vagues*. He orchestrated the first two acts but not the third and had not composed the last scene. D'Indy and others were consulted and declared that the work could not be completed. However, the contemporary composer Nicholas Bacri thinks otherwise and has been working on a completion, which we must hope will be recorded when it is performed.

Albéric Magnard was killed defending his home at the beginning of the first World War. His house was set on fire and several works were lost. The vocal score of his last opera *Guercoeur* survived but most of the orchestral score was destroyed. It was reconstructed by Guy Ropartz and has been recorded by Michel Plasson (EMI).

Another Franck disciple who died prematurely was Guillaume Lekeu, who died young, leaving a number of unfinished works. The cello sonata and the piano quartet were completed by d'Indy. The cello sonata is a long work in four movements; there are recordings by Guilhon-Herbert and Meunier (Saphir), Dewes and Devos (Ricercar) and Wallfisch and York (Cello Classics). Of the piano quartet Lekeu left the first movement and most of the second, which d'Indy finished. He left no material for the projected third and final movement. There are recordings by the enlarged Hochelaga Trio (Atma), the enlarged Spiller Trio (Arts), the Frith piano quartet (Nimbus) and Domus (Ricercar).

Chabrier only managed to complete one act of his last opera *Briséis*. Of the rest he left only sketches, and even d'Indy could make nothing of them. The one complete act has been recorded by Jean-Yves Ossonce (Hyperion).

Fauré's *Requiem* developed slowly over a long period. The first performance of parts of it was in 1888 and the first complete liturgical performance in 1889. There is a reconstruction of this by Marc Rigaudière, recorded by Stephen Cleobury (King's College Cambridge). By 1893 Fauré had added two further sections and slightly enlarged the orchestra to a chamber ensemble. However, he did not publish this and he enlarged the orchestra again for the 1901 published version, in which, however, his pupil Jean Roger-Ducasse may have had a hand; it also has many misprints. In recent years scholars have worked on reconstructing the 1893 version, which does not survive as such, as Fauré added the additional parts to his autograph score. John Rutter was the first to make and record a version of the 1893 score (Collegium). However, he did not have access to the surviving set of the 1893 orchestral

parts. These were drawn on by Jean-Michel Nectoux and Roger Delage for what is now the standard score of this version, published in 1994. The first recording of it was by Philippe Herreweghe (Harmonia Mundi HMG 501292). (This was made before the score was published, which has some revisions.) John Eliot Gardiner recorded the published edition (Philips). There are many recordings of the 1901 version, including such classics as the first King's College Cambridge one, under David Willcocks (EMI), but the score needed tidying up, which was done first by Roger Fiske in 1979 and then by Nectoux again, this time with Reiner Zimmerman, in a score published in 2001. Herreweghe again was the first to record this edition (Harmonia Mundi HMC901771).

Debussy left almost as many uncompleted works as Schubert, including no fewer than three operas. When he had won the *Prix de Rome* he worked on a cantata for orchestra with wordless chorus, *Printemps*, but sent back to Paris only a vocal score with piano duet saying that the full score had been lost in a fire. He later allowed Henri Büsser to make an orchestral arrangement and this is widely recorded. However, the conductor Emil de Cou has reconstructed the original, reinstating the chorus and opening the cuts Büsser had made. This has been recorded by him (Arabesque) and is well worth hearing. Another early work was the opera *Rodrigue et Chimène*; three of the projected four acts exist in short score or vocal score; the last act is missing. The surviving score was completed by Richard Langham Smith and orchestrated by Edison Denisov; it has been recorded by Kent Nagano (Erato). A more recent version by Robert Orledge is due to be recorded shortly.

There is an important textual detail in *La Mer* worth dwelling on. As originally composed, it included some brass fanfares in the last movement, which Debussy deleted in revision. Modern scores do not include them, but you can find them [here](#). Many conductors reinstate them, including Herbert von Karajan (DG), Bernard Haitink (Philips), Colin Davis (Philips) and Charles Dutoit (Decca), and the texture certainly seems thin without them.

Debussy worked off and on over a number of years on two one-act operas, *Le Diable dans le Beffroi* and *La Chute de la Maison Usher*. He left a few pages of music for the first and rather more for the second. Juan-Allende Blin reconstructed part of *Usher*, and this was recorded by Georges Prêtre (EMI). More recently Orledge has reconstructed both operas, which have been recorded with great success by Christoph-Mathias Mueller (Pan Classics). I suspect these are more pastiche composition than reconstruction, but they are nevertheless very convincing.

Debussy's *Trois chansons de Bilitis* for voice and piano were his first engagement with this work by Pierre Louÿs. He then wrote *Les chansons de Bilitis*, an entirely separate stage work in twelve numbers for reciter and small ensemble, including a celesta. He did not publish this version and the celesta part was lost. It was first reconstructed by Pierre Boulez, unpublished, and then by Arthur Hoeree, which has been published and is now standard. It has been recorded by Catherine Deneuve and Ensemble Wien-Berlin (DG) and by Delphine Seyrig and the Nash Ensemble (Erato). There is another edition by Rudolf Escher and Dirk Jacob Hamoen. Debussy later adapted six movements first for piano four hands, and later for solo piano, and published them as *Six épigraphes antiques*.

At the end of his life Debussy planned a series of six sonatas. He completed only the first three: for violin and piano, cello and piano, and flute, viola and harp. The others would have been for oboe, harpsichord and horn, for piano, clarinet, bassoon and trumpet, and for a mixed ensemble. Some years ago, the Lincoln Center in New York had the imaginative idea of commissioning three contemporary composers to write the three missing sonatas, though they were not bound to Debussy's idiom. The

composers they chose were Steven Stucky, Kaija Saariaho (whose work is for piano trio rather than the projected mixed ensemble) and Marc-André Dalbavie. The complete set of six was recorded (download from DG Concerts, available on CD from Lincoln Center). The Australian composer Lyle Chan and Orledge have each also written three sonatas with Debussy's proposed instrumentation. Chan's set is said to be forthcoming from ABC Classics; you can hear his No. 6 [here](#).

In his later years Debussy used others to help orchestrate his works. André Caplet worked on *Le Martyre de de Saint Sébastien*, and Charles Koechlin on *Khamma*; I have already mentioned Büsser's version of *Printemps*, and he also orchestrated the *Petite Suite*. From this it is a short step to other orchestrations, some by famous names. These include Ravel's of the *Danse (Tarantelle styriennne)* and the *Sarabande* from *Pour le Piano*, Ernest Ansermet's *Six épigraphes antiques*, Gustave Cloz and André Caplet's *Suite Bergamasque*, Percy Grainger's *Pagodes* and Leopold Stokowski's *Clair de lune, Soirée en Grenade* and *Cathédrale engloutie*.

There are several collections of these, with overlapping contents, from de Cou (Arabesque), Yoav Talmi (Atma), Zoltán Kocsis (Hungaroton, with both Debussy and Ravel) and two from Jun Märkl (Naxos). The Grainger *Pagodes* come from Simon Rattle (EMI). More recent orchestrations are the Colin Matthews *Préludes* from Mark Elder (Hallé), the John Adams Baudelaire songs from Yan Pascal Tortelier (Warner), the Brett Dean *Ariettes oubliées* from Robin Ticciati (Linn). and the Robin Holloway two-piano suite *En blanc et noir* from Märkl.

There are other orchestrations and Orledge in particular has devoted a good deal of time to reconstructing, reimagining and orchestrating many works which Debussy left unfinished. Some of his versions have yet to be recorded. There is a list of them [here](#).

Ravel wrote several works first for piano and then orchestrated them or parts of them himself. Of the five movement piano suite *Miroirs*, he orchestrated only the third, *Une barque sur l'océan*, and the fourth, *Alborada del gracioso*. Of the others, some have orchestrated individual pieces; these include Percy Grainger's remarkable version of *La Vallée des cloches*, recorded by Simon Rattle (EMI). So far as I know, only Michael Round has orchestrated all three of the pieces Ravel did not, thereby completing the suite in an orchestral version. This has been recorded by Vladimir Ashkenazy (Exton). The situation with *Le tombeau de Couperin* is similar: of the six movements of the piano version, Ravel orchestrated four, omitting the Fugue and the Toccata. Several composers have orchestrated the two missing movements to complete the suite; recordings include Ashkenazy again (Exton) and Zoltán Kocsis on the disc with Debussy (Hungaroton). Of other orchestral transcriptions I must at least mention that by Marius Constant of *Gaspard de la nuit*, recorded by Christoph Eschenbach (Ondine), and that of the piano trio by Yan Pascal Tortelier (Chandos).

Lili Boulanger would have been a great composer had she lived longer, and, even given her early death, what she achieved was pretty remarkable. She worked on an opera based on a play by Maeterlinck, *La Princesse Maleine*, which she was not able to complete. What happened to her drafts is unclear, but this might be a candidate for completion, if enough remains.

On arriving in the USA Varèse wrote *Amérique*, for very large orchestra. However, the standard version was preceded by an earlier and longer one for even larger orchestra. This has been edited by the Varèse specialist Chou Wen-chung and recorded by Riccardo Chailly, in his useful set of Varèse's (nearly) complete works (Decca). This set also includes Antony Beaumont's orchestral version of

Varèse's only surviving early song and Chou's reconstructions of *Tuning Up*, *Dance for Burgess* and *Nocturnal*, Varèse's last work. Of his projected choral work *Espace*, he completed only an *Étude*. Chou at first thought Varèse had made contradictory revisions to this which made it unperformable, but more recently changed his mind. His reconstruction has not yet been commercially recorded but you can hear it [here](#).

The score of Messiaen's early *Hymne au Saint Sacrement* was lost during the war, and he reconstructed it from memory in 1947. The extant score probably benefits from the greater mastery he had achieved in the intervening years and deserves to be better known.

At his death Messiaen left a few unfinished works. The largest of these was the quadruple concerto for flute, oboe, cello and piano, *Concert à Quatre*. His widow Yvonne Loriod, assisted by Heinz Holliger and George Benjamin, orchestrated part of the first movement and all of the last, and also supplied a cadenza. It has been recorded by Myung-Whun Chung (DG). Peter Hill unearthed, completed and recorded a piano work, *La Fauvette passerinette*, possibly intended for a projected second *Catalogue d'oiseaux* (Delphian). There is also a valuable disc of fugitive and unpublished works, *Inédits*, including four short pieces for Ondes Martenot and piano assembled by Yvonne Loriod (Jade).

Boulez had the inconvenient habit of withdrawing or partially withdrawing some works and then sometimes issuing new versions. Thanks to recording, some of the withdrawn works can still be heard, such as the early *Polyphonie X* and *Poésie pour Pouvoir* (Col Legno). His largest work, *Pli selon Pli*, exists in two main versions; the composer's first two recordings are of the first version (Sony and Erato), his third, of the final version (DG). It remains to be seen whether his estate will release early versions of works he revised, or works he completed but withdrew, such as the other movements of the third piano sonata, of which he only approved one movement for publication.

### Switzerland

The rise in interest in Frank Martin, at least on record, has led to even his most fugitive works being recorded. *Ein Totentanz zu Basel im Jahre 1943* was an occasional work which has only been performed twice. Bastiaan Blomhert put the score into order and recorded it complete (CPO). He also made a suite from it. This has been recorded by Matthew Westgate (MSR Classics), together with the chamber version of Martin's *Concerto pour les instruments à vent et le piano*, which is an early work, not to be confused with the well known *Concerto pour sept instruments à vent, timbales, batterie et orchestre à cordes*. Thierry Fischer's collection of flute works includes Ernest Ansermet's orchestration of the *Ballade* for flute, which precedes Martin's own, the orchestration by Viktor Desarzens of the *Sonata da chiesa* and Martin's own flute version of the *Ballade* for saxophone (Musiques Suisses).

### Russian School

Borodin left his opera *Prince Igor* unfinished and it was completed from sketches and memory by Rimsky-Korsakov and Glazunov. A scene by scene account of their contributions is available [here](#). (Rimsky-Korsakov's role in making performing editions of the work of his compatriots cannot be overestimated, though he freely recomposed and rearranged in a way even the boldest of modern scholars would hesitate to do.) This is the standard version, with recordings by Oskar Danon (Eloquence) and Mark Ermler (Melodiya) among others. Some other recordings omit the third act, which is mostly by Glazunov. Valery Gergiev recorded a new reconstruction (Philips). This is based on a fresh examination of all the sources; it takes into account an unpublished vocal score by Pavel Lamm,



which reverses the order of the first two acts and has some other changes, and it also has additional material by Yuri Faliek. Another new edition, by Dmitri Tcherniakov and the conductor Gianandrea Noseda, was mounted and recorded by the Metropolitan opera (DG DVD).

Borodin also did not complete his third symphony, or rather, he did not write it all down. Two movements were reconstructed by Glazunov, partly from memory. There are numerous recordings, including Loris Tjeknavorian (RCA) and Neeme Järvi (DG).

Mussorgsky worked on many operatic projects but completed few of them. He left two versions of *Boris Godunov*: the 1869 original and his revision of 1872, with extra scenes but also cuts. In practice, most productions are conflated, drawing on both versions, making cuts, moving scenes and otherwise reorganizing the work. Furthermore, for many years it was heard in Rimsky-Korsakov's revision, which not only provided a more colourful orchestration but also revised Mussorgsky's harmonies on more traditional lines. There is a full account of the different versions [here](#). The Rimsky-Korsakov version has nowadays been largely abandoned. A later version by Shostakovich does not seem to have been much taken up (unlike his *Khovanshchina*) but has been recorded by Dušan Miladinovic (Arkadia). For a conflated version which aims to provide the best from the composer's two versions the obvious choice is Claudio Abbado (Sony). Those who dislike conflation will want Valery Gergiev, who provides complete performances of both 1869 and 1872 (with some adaptation) in one box (Philips). For the Rimsky-Korsakov version the fullest version is Mark Ermler (Regis). Otherwise, I again refer readers to Ralph Moore's comprehensive survey [here](#).

Mussorgsky left *Khovanshchina* unfinished and here the ministrations of Rimsky-Korsakov were even more needed and even sooner came under criticism. Diaghilev commissioned new orchestrations from Ravel and Stravinsky working together, but their score was lost at the Revolution, apart from the closing chorus, by Stravinsky, which had been published. (I suppose it is not impossible the score may yet turn up, as did Stravinsky's *Chant funèbre*.) Rimsky-Korsakov's version continued to be performed and recorded until Shostakovich made a new version from the authentic vocal score, and this has generally replaced it. Claudio Abbado's recording (DG) uses this, somewhat adapted to bring it closer to Mussorgsky's intentions, with Stravinsky's ending. Valery Gergiev's version (Philips) uses Shostakovich without some of his additions. There are more details [here](#).

Mussorgsky completed and performed *The Marriage (Zhenitba)* but only with piano accompaniment. Again there have been several orchestrations. The currently available one is by Gennady Rozhdestvensky (Melodiya). Zoltan Pesko made a version of scenes from *Salammbô* (Warner). There have been several attempts at completing *Sorochyntsi Fair* (the title is spelled in many different ways); the one which has become established is by Vissarion Shebalin. There have been recordings by Vladimir Esipov (Olympia) and Evgeny Brazhnik (Brilliant Classics) and there is a useful review [here](#).

*St John's Night on Bald Mountain*, to give it its proper title, had a complicated history, which you can read [here](#). Again, the score was put into shape by Rimsky-Korsakov, and his version continues to be played. There are many recordings; a personal favourite is Georg Solti (Decca). Of Mussorgsky's original a good account is Claudio Abbado (DG), which also contains the surviving fragments of some other opera projects, as edited by Rimsky-Korsakov. Mussorgsky's own choral version was intended for an opera. Abbado has recorded this also (Sony).

*Pictures at an exhibition* was written for solo piano but has become enormously popular through the orchestration by Ravel. However, Ravel's version is only one of at least twenty. There is a list of them [here](#); not all have been recorded. Of the others I shall mention only Leopold Stokowski (Decca), which has also had several recordings by other conductors; I have a particular fondness for Matthias Bamert (Chandos). The piano original is also frequently recorded, but some pianists follow Vladimir Horowitz (RCA) in embellishing Mussorgsky's rather un pianistic writing; these include Mikhail Pletnev (Virgin Classics) and Leif Ove Andsnes (EMI).

The *Songs and Dances of Death* were written for voice and piano. Mussorgsky intended to orchestrate them but never did. There have been several orchestrations, starting with Rimsky-Korsakov and Glazunov working together, recorded by Boris Christoff (EMI), and others including Shostakovich, recorded by Sergei Aleksashkin (Eloquence) and Sergei Leiferkus (DG), Edison Denisov, recorded by Vladislav Sulimsky (Oehms) and Kalevi Aho, recorded by Matti Salminen (BIS).

Tchaikovsky's second symphony was written in 1872 and considerably revised in 1880. This revised version is what is normally played, but the composer Taneyev, who was a great friend, and others have preferred the first version. The only recording of it so far is by Geoffrey Simon (Chandos). As with Prokofiev's fourth symphony, both versions really deserve to remain in circulation.

In addition to the six numbered symphonies and the unnumbered *Manfred*, Tchaikovsky drafted a symphony in E flat which would have come between the fifth and sixth. He abandoned the project and used the material of the first movement in his third piano concerto, Op. 75, in one movement, published posthumously. This is all that is usually played. However, the other two movements were worked up by Taneyev in a piano concertante work as *Andante and Finale*. This was also included in Tchaikovsky's catalogue posthumously as Op. 79. There have been several recordings of Opp. 75 and 79 together as a synthetic complete third concerto, for example by Peter Jablonski (Decca) and Konstantin Scherbakov (Naxos). In the 1950s Semyon Bogatyrev worked over the material again and reconstructed the symphony, adding a scherzo orchestrated from a piano piece (Op. 72 No. 10), for which Tchaikovsky had used material drafted for the symphony, and called it, rather misleadingly, No. 7 (I suppose 5½ would have been absurd). The first recording was by Eugene Ormandy (RCA). Subsequent recordings include Neeme Järvi (Chandos) and Dmitri Kitajenko (Oehms). It is an attractive work, if not quite first-rate Tchaikovsky, and I consider the material works better as a symphony than as a concerto. There has been another, more recent, reconstruction of the symphony, by Pyotr Klimov, but this has not yet been recorded.

If you count both versions of the second symphony, *Manfred* and the Bogatyrev reconstruction, there are really nine Tchaikovsky symphonies. Complete cycles nowadays usually include *Manfred* along with the six numbered works; so far, only Ormandy (Sony) also includes the Bogatyrev reconstruction. No one has yet included the first version of the second symphony.

In his later years Scriabin had a grandiose and unrealizable project for a work to be called *Mysterium*. He completed seventy-odd sketch pages of a preliminary work called *Prefatory Action for the Final Mystery*. These came into the hands of Sergei Protopopov, a remarkable composer who, however, did nothing with them. They were then taken up by Alexander Nemtin, who spent many years creating an orchestral work with solo piano based on them. It has been recorded by Vladimir Ashkenazy with Alexei Lubimov (Decca). This is worth hearing, though it is so long – nearly three hours – that it must

be largely pastiche, and the idiom actually seems less advanced than some of Scriabin's final piano pieces.

Rachmaninov's first version of his Piano Concerto No. 1 dates from 1892. He revised it in 1917, universally considered a great improvement and what is usually played. The 1892 version has been recorded by Karina Wisniewska (Musica Classic 780010-2) and also by Alexandre Ghindin (Ondine). Similarly, Rachmaninov twice revised his Piano Concerto No. 4. Most recordings are of the final version of 1941, but there are a few, such as Ghindin again (Ondine) and Sudbin (BIS) of the 1926 first version, and one, William Black (Chandos), of the intermediate 1928 version. I should also mention here Alan Kogowski's orchestration of the *Trio Elégiaque* as a concerto (Chandos), coupled with an orchestration by Corneliu Dumbraveanu of the *Corelli Variations*.

Rachmaninov revised and considerably shortened his Piano Sonata No. 2 many years after he first composed it. Some pianists play either the original, such as Leslie Howard (Melba) or the revised version, such as Peter Jablonski (Decca), but Horowitz (RCA) – with the composer's approval – made a conflation of the two versions, itself revised more than once, and many others have followed this exactly or with some changes, such as Nikolai Lugansky (Naïve), Yevgeny Sudbin (BIS) and Steven Osborne (Hyperion).

Rachmaninov completed the first act in short score of an operatic setting of Maeterlinck's play *Monna Vanna*, but discovered that the rights had been given to another composer. Igor Buketoff orchestrated the draft and recorded it (Chandos), coupled with the 1928 version of the Piano Concerto No. 4. There is another orchestration by Gennadi Belov, recorded by Vladimir Ashkenazy (Ondine).

Stravinsky's *Chante funèbre* (Funeral Song), in memory of Rimsky-Korsakov, who was his teacher, was given one performance in 1909 and then forgotten. The score was lost at the revolution but the parts were discovered in 2015 and the score reconstructed. The first recording was by Riccardo Chailly (Decca), since when there have been at least two more.

Three of the Diaghilev ballets do not raise any issues of reconstruction, though listeners should note that for *The Firebird*, as well as the complete original ballet of 1910 there are three different suites, 1911, 1919 and 1945. Stravinsky made a piano solo version of the ballet for rehearsal. This has been recorded by Lydia Jardon (AR Ré-S), together with *Le Chant du Rossignol*, uncredited but probably transcribed by Arthur Lourié. Stravinsky also allowed Guido Agosti to make a virtuoso transcription of the last three numbers; this is often included in recordings of Stravinsky's piano music, for example that by Martin Jones (Nimbus).

There are two different versions of *Petrushka*, 1911 and 1947. The differences are mainly ones of orchestration, but they do change the character of the work. Dorati made a conflation of the two, basically using 1947 but in some passages reverting to 1911, following his memories of the composer's unrealised ideal version (Decca – his Mercury version is 1947). The piano duet version Stravinsky made for rehearsal has occasionally been recorded, for example by Katya Apekisheva and Charles Owen (Quartz), along with the duet version of *The Rite of Spring*. The *Three movements from Petrushka* which Stravinsky arranged for Artur Rubinstein are quite a different proposition, being a virtuoso vehicle, with the piano part elaborated from the orchestral version. There are numerous recordings, classics including Rubinstein himself (RCA) and Maurizio Pollini (DG). Drawing on both the duet version

and the *Three movements*, Mikhail Rudy made and recorded a complete solo piano version (EMI). This has not been published, but there is an uncredited solo piano version published by Schirmer.

*The Rite of Spring* was first performed in 1913 but the score was repeatedly revised, and the current standard version dates from 1967. The changes mostly affect notation and instrumentation, but Stravinsky rescored the final Sacrificial Dance in 1943 in a version which was not incorporated into the 1967 score and is consequently not often performed. (We could do with a proper critical edition of the whole work.) This has been used by Stravinsky himself (Sony) and Robert Craft (Naxos). David Zinman has recorded the original (pre-performance) 1913 version side by side with the 1943/1967 one (Sony). The piano duet version Stravinsky made for rehearsal is nowadays frequently used as a recital work, as already mentioned. There is no official piano solo version; Artur Schnabel apparently made one and played it to Stravinsky but did not publish it. The one by Vladimir Leyetchkiss was apparently approved by the composer. It was recorded by Ralph van Raat (Naxos) and Svetlana Bel'sky (Centaur), and there is an earlier one by Sam Raphling, recorded by Dickran Atamian (Delos) and Eric Ferrand N'Kaoua (Grand Piano).

The fourth Diaghilev ballet *Les Noces* (The Wedding) is more problematic. Stravinsky started work on this after *The Rite of Spring*, but completion was delayed both by the war and by his difficulty in settling on the instrumentation. His first idea for a very large orchestra was abandoned, as were two other ideas. In 1917 he almost completed a version with chamber orchestra. Still dissatisfied, in 1919 he started one for an ensemble of two cimbalons, a pianola, a harmonium and percussion, but abandoned it after the first two scenes as impractical, even though he later thought that this was the best realization. Finally, he rescored it for four pianos and percussion, completing this in 1923. This is the standard version, frequently recorded. The one by James Wood (Hyperion) is a favourite of mine. The early versions are also well worth hearing. The 1917 version was put into performable form by the team of Colin Matthews, Ramiro Cortez, William Harkins and Robert Craft, who made the first recording (Columbia LP M33201, not transferred to CD but available as a download from Sony). This is coupled with the 1919 version, which also needed some filling out, carried out by Colin Matthews. There is a more recent recording of 1917 and 1923 together by Peter Eötvös (Hungaroton). René Bosc recorded 1923 and the two scenes of 1919 (Radio France). The third and fourth scenes of 1919 were realized by Theo Verbey; René Bosc did not include them in his CD recording but you can hear his performance of them [here](#). A few years ago Steven Stucky made yet another version, not yet recorded, retaining the percussion but replacing the pianos with a normal orchestra. It is greatly to the credit of the publishers (Chester) that scores of all these versions are available.

*Symphonies of Wind Instruments* exists in two versions, 1920 and 1947. In the revision Stravinsky revised the notation and replaced the alto flute and alto clarinet with the standard instruments and so also had to modify the music. Both versions remain in circulation. Most conductors, including Robert Craft (Sony), prefer 1947; some, such as Boulez (Sony and DG) and Dutoit (Decca), prefer 1920, and so do I. Stravinsky first published the closing section as a piano solo. He then authorized Arthur Lourié to complete the transcription, included in some recordings of Stravinsky's piano music, such as Martin Jones (Nimbus). Lourié also made authorised piano transcriptions of two other Stravinsky works, recorded by Benedikt Koehlen, the *Concertino for string quartet* (Telos Music), and the *Octet* (Arte Nova). Stravinsky himself made his own piano transcriptions of *Ragtime* and the *Circus Polka*. These are also usually included in recordings of his piano works. The one he made of *Apollon Musagète*

is not, and it is really just a rehearsal score, but it has been recorded by Christopher O'Riley (Nonesuch).

Towards the end of his life Stravinsky made sketches for an orchestral work he did not complete. Robert Craft and Stravinsky's widow invited Charles Wuorinen to design a work around these. The result was *A Reliquary for Igor Stravinsky*, recorded by Oliver Knussen (DG).

Prokofiev began work on the opera *Maddalena* in his student years. He completed the piano score and started work on the orchestration but abandoned it when hopes for a performance faded. After his death his widow asked the conductor Edward Downes to complete it. This was recorded by Gennady Rozhdestvensky (Olympia). There is another orchestration, by Sergei Gavrilov, which has been recorded by Kirill Tikhonov (Melodiya).

Prokofiev completed his second piano concerto in 1913. But the score was lost in the Revolution and he reconstructed it from memory in 1923, saying he had completely rewritten it. This is the only score, and it is regularly recorded.

Prokofiev wrote a good deal of incidental music for plays and film music. Most of the incidental music has been gathered together and recorded by Vladimir Jurowski, though the convenient three disc set (Capriccio 7001) does not include *Pique Dame* (Capriccio 67149). The music for *Eugene Onegin* was reassembled and orchestrated by Edward Downes, whose own recording has the spoken parts in English (Chandos). Some of the film music was turned into suites, and *Lieutenant Kijé* and *Alexander Nevsky* are well known in that form. The original film score for *Alexander Nevsky* was first reconstructed by William Brohn and recorded by Yuri Temirkanov (RCA) and again in a new version by Frank Strobel (Capriccio). Several concert versions of *Ivan the Terrible* have been produced. Abram Stasevich's is the most commonly recorded. I particularly recommend the Christopher Palmer version, recorded by Neeme Järvi (Chandos). You can see the complete list [here](#).

At his death Prokofiev left his *Cello Concertino* unfinished. It was completed by Rostropovich and orchestrated by Kabalevsky. Rostropovich made the first recording (Warner) since when there have been several others. It was reorchestrated in a lighter manner for chamber orchestra by Vladimir Blok and this version has been recorded by Steven Isserlis (Virgin Classics and BIS) and Alexander Rudin (Naxos).

Shostakovich allowed Rudolf Barshai to arrange some of his string quartets for string orchestra, then called *Chamber Symphonies*, and confirmed his approval by giving them opus numbers in his catalogue. Barshai recorded a collection of them (DG) and a larger one (Brilliant Classics). Misha Rachlevsky made a similar arrangement of String Quartet No. 15, recorded by him (Claves). Shostakovich also approved another version of his String Quartet No. 8, by Abram Stasevich, which added timpani to the string band. This has been recorded by Paavo Järvi (Alpha). There are also some arrangements by others.

Shostakovich wrote music for many films and plays. There are two substantial collections of his film music, by Vassily Sinaisky (Chandos) and by Dmitry Yablonsky (Naxos) as well as single discs, for example from Riccardo Chailly (Decca) and Vladimir Jurowski (Capriccio). His incidental music for plays has not yet been systematically collected, and some of it is lost, but some has appeared, such as that to *Hamlet* (two stage productions, not the same as the film score) and *King Lear* from Mark Elder

(Signum) and there are others by Mark FitzGerald (Naxos). Some of these have involved a good deal of reconstruction.

Shostakovich abandoned immediate plans for further operas after Stalin condemned *Lady Macbeth of Mtsensk*. However, during the Second World War he began an opera using Gogol's play *The Gamblers* as libretto. He completed only the first of three projected acts. This has been recorded by Gennady Rozhdestvensky, coupled with *The Nose* (Melodiya), and by Vasily Petrenko, coupled with Shostakovich's completion and orchestration of the one act opera *Rothschild's Violin* by his pupil Veniamin Fleishman (Avie). *The Gamblers* was completed by Krzysztof Meyer and recorded by Vladimir Jurowski (Capriccio). There are sketches for several other operas. The revised version of *Lady Macbeth*, retitled *Katerina Izmailova* and recorded by Gennady Provorov (Melodiya), is nowadays usually abandoned in favour of the original version, first recorded by Rostropovich (EMI), who said this was the composer's preference. However, Maxim Shostakovich, the composer's son, apparently planned to use a conflated version, which casts some doubt on this, but his recording was never made.

### Scandinavia and Eastern Europe

Grieg's string quartet in G minor is well known. He began a companion, in F major, but completed just the first two movements, leaving only sketches for the rest. Most recordings offering the second quartet include only these two movements. This is also true of Alf Årdal's arrangements for string orchestra under Stephan Barratt-Due (Naxos). After Grieg's death, his friend the composer Julius Röntgen completed the quartet from the sketches. This completion was long neglected until the Raphael Quartet made the first recording (Olympia). Another, much shorter, completion is by Levon Chilingirian, leader of his quartet (Hyperion).

Sibelius's original music for *Karelia* consisted of eleven movements, of which the composer drew on three for the well-known suite. Sibelius destroyed the original score, but it was mostly reconstructed from the surviving parts by Kalevi Kuosa. The missing parts, which were the lower string lines, have been supplied in two different reconstructions: by Kalevi Aho, recorded by Osmo Vänska (BIS-CD 915) and by Jouni Kaipainen, recorded by Tuomas Ollila (Ondine). Aho also orchestrated Sibelius's *1897 Cantata for a university graduation ceremony* from the surviving vocal score, recorded among the choral works in the BIS complete Sibelius edition.

The original version of Sibelius's violin concerto is even more demanding than the revised one. It was unknown until 1991 when the estate permitted a performance and recording by Leonidas Kavakos (BIS). Similarly, the original version of the fifth symphony has been reconstructed from the parts and recorded by Osmo Vänska, together with the first version of *En Saga* (BIS).

But the great mystery with Sibelius is, of course, the eighth symphony. Sibelius said he had completed it 'several times,' but was not satisfied with it and burned his drafts. More recently, sketches were found which might have been for it, and it is also possible he may have reused some of the material in some of the late works he did publish. You can hear a version of the sketches [here](#). Although completing the symphony has been suggested, it is doubtful whether enough material survives to do so.

Aarre Merikanto was at his best in his modernist period, but it was also his least successful. He suffered from depression, during which he destroyed some scores and mutilated others, tearing out odd pages. Two mutilated scores have been reconstructed by Paavo Heininen, who had been his pupil. These are



Merikanto's boldest work, the *Symphonic Study*, recorded, along with the composer's other most adventurous works, in a valuable disc by Leif Segerstam (Finlandia), and the String Sextet, which has not yet been recorded. The Nonet had to be reconstructed from the parts and has been recorded by Ulf Söderblom (Ondine). The composer Paavo Heininen has also reimagined the third violin concerto, which Merikanto destroyed completely, under the title *Tuuminki* (A Notion), but this has also not as yet been recorded.

Uno Klami did not complete his projected ballet *Pyörteitä* (*Whirls*). He split the music he had written for the second act into two suites, which were recorded by Osmo Vänska (BIS CD 656). Later, piano scores of the first two acts were found. Kalevi Aho undertook the orchestration of the first act, which was recorded separately by Vänska (BIS CD 696). The third act was missing; Aho wrote music for that too, and when a projected performance did not materialize, recast it as his *Symphonic Dances*, also recorded by Vänska (BIS CD 1336). You will need all three discs to assemble a complete recording of the ballet, which should be seen as a joint work by both composers. Maybe BIS would be prepared to join them up together in one set.

Kalevi Aho also completed the orchestration of the last work of Einojuhani Rautavaara, his *Two Serenades for violin and orchestra*. We must hope for a recording.

Janáček was dissatisfied with his piano sonata *1. X. 1905*. He took the third movement, a funeral march, from the pianist at the rehearsal and burned it on the spot. He later threw the manuscript of the surviving first two movements into the Vltava river. Fortunately, the pianist Ludmila Tučková, who had played them, had made a copy of them. She revealed it many years later, and Janáček permitted publication. This work is frequently recorded. No one has tried to reconstruct the lost finale. There is an orchestration of the two surviving movements by Reinbert de Leeuw (Alpha) and another by Theo Verbey, which you can hear [here](#).

Janáček wrote *The Diary of One who Disappeared* as a cantata for tenor, alto, female voices and piano. However, he also envisaged a stage version, and the score was orchestrated after his death by Ota Zitek and Vaclav Sedláček for this purpose. This has been recorded by Claudio Abbado (DG). There is also a chamber ensemble version by Reinbert de Leeuw (Etcetera).

Many of Janáček's works were first published in versions which did not reflect his wishes, and there has been a long process of cleaning up the scores. Charles Mackerras played a key role in this. In the case of the *Glagolitic Mass* the composer had to simplify some of the writing before the premiere, and further revisions were made before the final version, which became standard. Paul Wingfield reconstructed the original version, whose first recording was by Charles Mackerras (Chandos – Mackerras also recorded the standard version on Supraphon). Tomáš Netopil (Supraphon) reconstructs the 1927 first performance version. There is a review and discussion of the differences [here](#).

Martinů wrote his last opera, *The Greek Passion*, in English, with a view to a production at Covent Garden. However, this London version of 1957 was rejected and he revised and largely rewrote it. This revised version was first produced posthumously, in 1961 in Zürich. Many years later the London version was reconstructed by Aleš Březina in a production which did later come to Covent Garden. Both versions continue in circulation. Mackerras performed both versions but recorded only the Zürich



one (Supraphon). The London version has been recorded by Ulf Schirmer (Koch Schwann) and (slightly cut) by Dirk Kaftan (Oehms).

Bartók's *Miraculous Mandarin*, his boldest score, is best-known from the Suite, which has about two thirds of the music, but the complete ballet is far preferable, though the requirement of a chorus means it is less often performed. It turns out that about thirty bars had been cut from the previously published score of the ballet version. These were restored by the composer's son Peter Bartók with Nelson Dellamaggiore from manuscript sources and the piano four hands version, with the revised score published in 2000. The first recording to include the extra passage was by David Robertson (Harmonia Mundi) and there is another by Marin Alsop (Naxos).

Bartók left two works unfinished at his death. In the case of the Piano Concerto No. 3 it was only the orchestration of the last seventeen bars which was lacking. This was supplied by Tibor Serly, and the work has joined the repertoire with many recordings, personal favourites being Géza Anda (DG) and Zoltán Kocsis (Philips). The Viola Concerto is a good deal more problematic. Although Bartók had claimed it was nearly complete, in fact he had left only sketches. Again Tibor Serly came to the rescue, but the task this time was much more difficult and his version has been twice revised, by Bartók's son Peter with Nelson Dellamaggiore, who slightly enlarged the orchestra, and again by Csaba Erdélyi. Recordings should say which version they are using, which is usually Serly. The first recording of the Erdelyi version was by himself with Marc Taddei conducting (Concordance). The one by Hong-Mei Xiao conducted by János Kovács (Naxos) contains both the Tibor Serly and the Peter Bartók versions. There is also a transcription for the work for cello, which has been recorded by János Starker (RCA) and Raphael Wallfisch (Nimbus). Although violists have seized on the work as a major addition to their meagre concerto repertoire, I have to say that I have not yet been convinced by any version.

Enescu was a perfectionist and this, together with his life as a travelling virtuoso, meant that he started but did not complete a number of works. Some of these were well advanced. Dates are often uncertain and opus numbers unhelpful. A number of composers and scholars, particularly Pascal Bentoiu, have retrieved several of them and put them into performable shape. Of the Symphony No. 4 Enescu left a complete sketch, but orchestrated only the first and part of the second of the three movements. The remainder was orchestrated by Bentoiu and has been recorded by Peter Ruzicka (CPO777 926). Enescu also left the Symphony No. 5 as a sketch and orchestrated only part of the first of the four movements. Bentoiu orchestrated the remainder and Ruzicka recorded it (CPO 777 823), coupled with the symphonic poem *Isis*, of which Enescu also left only a sketch, which Bentoiu orchestrated. These symphonies are really impressive. Enescu completed one movement and started another of the *Suite chatelaine*. These were put into performable shape and recorded by Remus Georgescu (Marco Polo). Enescu also planned a trilogy of symphonic poems to be called *Voix de la nature*, but wrote only part of the first part and all of the third. The first, *Nuages d'Automne sur les forêts* is coupled by Ruzicka with the fourth symphony. The third is *Vox maris*, which, contrary to some accounts, he did complete and is one of his most powerful orchestral works; it has been recorded by Ion Baciú (Marco Polo) and Cristian Mandeal (Arte Nova), who also has with it another recording of *Nuages d'Automne sur les forêts* under the overall title *Voix de la nature*.

Among concertante works the *Caprice roumain* was completed by Cornel Țăranu and recorded by Sherban Lupu (Electrocord).

Enescu's Piano Trio in A minor was only discovered after his death. It was edited by Hilda Jerea and then again by Bentoiu. This has been recorded several times, for example by Trio Brancusi (Zigzag) and Trio Enescu (Genuin). The version by the Schubert Quartet (Chandos) is based on a fresh study of the manuscript and differs somewhat from Bentoiu.

Enescu wrote a good deal of piano music. Raluca Stirbat (Hänssler) includes a number of early works as well as the published ones. However, no recording can include the second of the three piano sonatas Enescu composed, since, although he said he had it in his head and even gave it the number Op. 24 No. 2, he never wrote it down.

Enescu left a piano score of his cantata *Strigoli* (Ghosts) and an incomplete short score with indications of orchestration. This was edited by Cornel Țăranu and orchestrated by the composer Sabin Păuța and has been recorded by Gabriel Bebeșelea (Capriccio).

Given the problematic nature of so many Enescu works, I perhaps need to say that he did complete his masterpiece, the opera *Oedipe*, which was performed in his lifetime and has been recorded several times, notably by Lawrence Foster (EMI) and Michael Gielen (Naxos). It is also possible that other currently lost works may turn up and be put into performable shape.

### Germany and Second Viennese School

Richard Strauss first envisaged the string work which became *Metamorphosen* as a work for eleven strings, then for a septet (string sextet plus a double bass). He later expanded it to a work for twentythree strings, in which form it has become well known. The draft of the septet version turned up in 1990 and was turned into a performing edition by Rudolf Leopold in 1991. There is a recording by the Nash Ensemble (Hyperion). This is very convincing; it deserves hearing alongside the sextet version of Schoenberg's *Verklärte Nacht*, with which *Metamorphosen* is often coupled, though in that case the chamber version is the original and the string orchestra version the composer's own later transcription. There is also a piano solo version, made by Gustave Samazeuilh and approved by the composer, which has only recently come to light; it has not yet been recorded.

The *Four Last Songs* were put together and given that title after Strauss's death by Ernest Roth, his friend and publisher. No one is going to change the grouping now, but it is worth noting that, at around the same time that he wrote these songs, Strauss made an orchestral version of his early song *Ruhe, meine Seele* Op. 27 No. 1, and it could have been added to the set before *Im Abendrot*, with which it has affinities. Felicity Lott included it, with the *Four Last Songs* and others in her first disc of Strauss's orchestral songs (Chandos 9054).

As with Liszt, it is hard to draw a firm line between Busoni's transcriptions and arrangements and his own compositions. His *Fantasia after J. S. Bach* draws on three works by Bach for a work of his own. Similarly, his fifth sonatina, the *Sonatina brevis in signo Joannis Sebastiani Magni*, uses material from Bach's *Fantasia and Fugue* BWV 905. There are numerous recordings of both of these, notably by Pöntinen (CPO) and Hamelin (Hyperion). The *Fantasia, Adagio e contains* C Minor Fantasia BWV 906, the Adagio BWV 968 (from the C Major Sonata for unaccompanied violin) and ends with Busoni's completion of the fragmentary C Minor Fugue BWV 906a. This and various other transcriptions and arrangements are in Holger Groschopp's set (Capriccio). The largest work of this kind is the *Fantasia Contrappuntistica*, which began as a completion of *Contrapunctus 14*, the final fugue from the Bach's *Art of Fugue*, already discussed above. Busoni adopted Bernard Ziehn's combination of its three

themes with the motto theme of the whole work but added a great of new material, some of it taken from other parts of the *Art of Fugue* and some of it his own. There are four versions of this work in all. The first, called *Grosse Fuge*, has been recorded by Holger Groschopp (Capriccio); the second, called *Fantasia Contrappuntistica* and subtitled *edizione definitiva* (but it was not to prove so) by numerous pianists such as Hamish Milne (Hyperion) but few, who include John Ogdon (Altarus) and Carlo Grante (Music and Arts), include the important passage Busoni relegated to an Appendix; the third the *Fantasia Contrappuntistica edizione minore* by Wolf Harden in volume 11 of his complete Busoni series (Naxos 8.573982); and the fourth, a version for two pianos, by Alan Schiller and John Humphreys (Naxos) and by Andras Schiff and Peter Serkin (ECM). These versions all differ and the pianist, composer and Busoni scholar Larry Sitsky proposed and performed a fifth, combining the best of all of them (details in his book on Busoni's piano music). However, this has not yet been recorded – it deserves to be. Busoni also wanted to orchestrate the work, but did not live to do so; there are orchestral versions by Sitsky, Antony Beaumont, Ira Levin and others, yet to be recorded.

Busoni's 'concert interpretation' of Schoenberg's piano piece Op. 11 No. 2 is in effect his idea of how Schoenberg should have composed it, so as it were a reconstruction after the event. Schoenberg was horrified. It has been recorded by Liska on a disc of Schoenberg arrangements (Capriccio) and by Holger Groschopp (Capriccio).

Busoni's last and greatest work, the opera *Doktor Faust*, he left unfinished, with both the scene in which Helen of Troy dances and the closing scene uncomposed. For many years, a stop-gap completion by Philipp Jarnach was used. Leitner's recording (DG) has this but is cut. However, in the 1980s the conductor and musicologist Antony Beaumont found Busoni's plans for the missing scenes, which drew on works he had already composed, and so was able to complete them. The resulting completed version has had several stage productions. Kent Nagano (Erato) is uncut and provides both the Jarnach and the Beaumont completions. Tomáš Netopil (Oehms) provides neither. More recently Larry Sitsky has also made a completion but this has yet to be recorded.

Schoenberg tended to be a fast worker, and, if he was interrupted while working on a composition, was often unable to pick up the threads to finish it. Among his many unfinished works and fragments are *Ein Stelldichein*, a work for chamber ensemble, which might have been a companion to *Verklärte Nacht*. It was supplemented and completed by Friedrich Cerha and recorded by Michael Lessky (Gramola). Similarly the third of his *Three Pieces for Chamber Orchestra* was left unfinished, as was his late *Modern Psalm*; both were recorded by Pierre Boulez (Sony). He was, however, able to complete his Second Chamber Symphony many years after he had started it. The numerous recordings include the Orpheus Chamber Orchestra (DG) and John Mauceri (Decca).

Despite his objections to what Busoni had done to his piano piece, Schoenberg was not averse to rehandling works by other composers. As well as his orchestrations of Bach and Brahms, he also revised two baroque works in ways which go beyond reconstruction to actual recomposition. First there was a Cello Concerto, after one by Matthias Georg Monn, and then a String Quartet Concerto, after Handel's Concerto Grosso in B flat Op. 6 No. 7. There is a convenient coupling of both of them from Jun Märkl (MDR Klassik).

Two large and important works were left unfinished. Work on the large-scale choral and orchestral work *Die Jakobsleiter* was interrupted by military service and never resumed. Schoenberg left a short score of the first part and the symphonic interlude which would have preceded the uncomposed

second part. Together these last about three quarters of an hour. After the composer's death Winfried Zillig orchestrated the draft, and revealed the work as one of great power and beauty. It has been several times recorded, notably by Pierre Boulez (Sony), Michael Gielen (Hänssler) and Kent Nagano (Harmonia Mundi).

Of Schoenberg's last opera, *Moses and Aron*, he left us the first two acts fully completed and scored. At the end of the second act Moses laments his inability to convey his vision of God effectively because of his lack of eloquence. Of the short third act Schoenberg left only the libretto. In this last act Moses confronts Aron, who falls dead. Most people, including myself, have found the two completed acts entirely satisfying in themselves, contrary to my usual approach in this article. There are numerous recordings, notably Michael Gielen (Philips) and Pierre Boulez (Sony and DG). Zoltán Kocsis made a musical setting of the third act. This has not yet been commercially recorded but you can hear it [here](#). (Alternatively, listen to Alexander Goehr's impressive cantata, *The Death of Moses*, close in feeling to Schoenberg (Unicorn-Kanchana).)

Berg gave a copy of the score of his second string quartet, the *Lyrical Suite*, to his secret love, Hanna Fuchs-Robettin. In 1977 the composer and Berg scholar George Perle examined it and found that it contained a secret programme which included a vocal line for the finale, written in shorthand. He reconstructed this and argued that Berg really intended it to be performed. (Schoenberg had previously included a voice in his own second string quartet.) This is debatable, but some recordings now include it. The first to do so was the Kronos Quartet (Nonesuch) and they have been followed by the Quatuor Diotima (Naïve) and the Petersen Quartet (Phoenix). The Emerson quartet (Decca) include both the published and the reconstructed versions, which is perhaps the best arrangement.

Berg completed the short score of his opera *Lulu* but broke off the orchestration in the third act to write his violin concerto and died before returning to the opera. (He had already orchestrated the closing scene for his *Lulu-Suite*.) His widow Helene approached several composers to complete the orchestration but all refused. She then turned against the work and tried to suppress knowledge of the third act. For many years the work was performed as a torso, and early recordings were of this version. Eventually Berg's publishers commissioned Friedrich Cerha to complete the orchestration, but this was withheld until after Helene Berg's death. The first performance of the completed version was in 1979 under Pierre Boulez, who made the first recording (DG). It is now frequently performed and recorded.

Webern left no incomplete works but a good deal of juvenilia which preceded his *Passacaglia*, his official Op. 1. Pierre Boulez included them, not in his first Webern set (Sony), which contains only the published works, but in his second (DG). The best known of these are the orchestral tone poem *Im Sommerwind* and the string quartet movement *Langsamer Satz*. These have each had several other recordings, for example Riccardo Chailly (Decca) and Giuseppe Sinopoli (Warner) for the tone poem, and the Schoenberg Quartet (Chandos) and the Quatuor Diotima (Naïve) for the quartet.

Zemlinsky had an early success with the tone-poem *Die Seejungfrau* but later effectively withdrew it, giving the score of the first movement to a friend, while that for the second and third movements went with him to the USA. They were not reunited until 1984. The first recording was by Riccardo Chailly (Decca). That by John Storgårds (Ondine) includes an extra passage cut by the composer and recovered by Antony Beaumont, whose own recording (Chandos) is of the standard version.

Zemlinsky wrote a number of orchestral songs, but of a projected cycle drafted in 1900-1 only two songs survive, and these in short score. They were orchestrated by Antony Beaumont for James Conlon's complete set of the orchestral songs (EMI).

His last opera, *Der König Kandaules*, he completed in a rather confused short score but had orchestrated only part of the first act. The remainder was edited and orchestrated by Antony Beaumont and has had several productions. There are recordings by Gerd Albrecht (Capriccio) and Kent Nagano (Andante).

Schreker wrote numerous operas but also for many years planned one that was never to be completed. This was *Memnon*. Instead, he used the materials in *Prelude to a Large Opera*, a very large-scale concert overture (not to be confused with *Prelude to a Drama*, which is the overture to *Die Gezeichneten*), and this has been recorded, for example by James Conlon (EMI), Vassily Sinaisky (Chandos) and Lawrence Renes (BIS).

Korngold wrote film scores as well as concert music, and in the general revival of interest in his work, these have also been recorded. Like most film scores, they need some editorial work. There have been a number of recordings, with several by William T. Stromberg (Naxos) and Rumon Gamba (Chandos) and I shall mention two more: *Between two worlds* (Decca) and *Previn conducts Korngold* (DG).

Hindemith completed his first string quartet in 1915 and listed it as his Opus 2. It was performed once but remained unpublished in his lifetime and was for long thought lost. The six later quartets were therefore assigned numbers 1 to 6 by the publishers. However, the early quartet eventually turned up and, since the composer had given it an opus number, was added to the canon, with the numbering of all the later quartets moved on by one. This has caused confusion. Older cycles, such as that by the Kocian (Praga Digital) have only the six long-standing ones, while newer ones such as the Juilliard (Wergo) and the Amar (Naxos) have all seven.

Kurt Weill was a *bête noire* of the Nazis. When he fled Germany he had to leave some of his scores behind, and to the end of his life thought they had been lost. What survived was sometimes in considerable disarray and it is taking a long time to produce authoritative scores. The series of Weill recordings on Capriccio is invaluable. Meirion Bowen rescored his early stage work, the children's pantomime *Zaubernacht* from the piano draft and this was recorded (Capriccio). However, Weill's own score then turned up which, of course, replaced it, and has itself now been recorded (CPO). *Royal Palace* was not so fortunate, and had to be reconstructed from the piano score by Gunther Schuller and Noam Sheriff; it has been recorded by Andrew Davis (Capriccio). Fortunately, the scores of *Aufstieg und Fall der Stadt Mahagonny* and *Die Bürgschaft* had been hidden, were recovered and have been recorded, by Jan Latham-König (Capriccio) and Julius Rudel (EMI) respectively. *Mahagonny* has had numerous productions. Weill did not carry out the orchestration of his operetta *Der Kuhhandel* (A kingdom for a cow) and this was done by Lys Symonette; excerpts have been recorded by Jan Latham König (Capriccio) and the complete work by Christoph Eberle (Phoenix Edition DVD). His enormous Biblical pageant *Der Weg der Verheissung* was reconstructed with the help of Noam Sheriff and John Mauceri. There are partial recordings (in English, not the original German), as *The Eternal Road* by Gerard Schwarz (Naxos) and a longer one as *The Road of Promise* by Ted Sperling (Navona Records).

Hanns Eisler did not complete his *Leipzig Symphony*, based on his film scores. This has been done by Thilo Medek and recorded by Bruns (Capriccio).

The Jewish composers imprisoned in the show camp or ghetto of Terezín (Theresienstadt) managed to continue composing, though generally on a small scale. The recovery and performance of some of their works is a story in itself; obviously a good deal of editorial work was needed. Of actual reconstructions I should mention Viktor Ullmann's two symphonies and his overture *Don Quixote tanzt Fandango*, orchestrated by Bernhard Wulff from his piano sonatas Nos. 5 and 7 and a short score (Capriccio). His opera *Der Kaiser von Atlantis* was worked over by several people, with the version with expanded orchestra by Ingo Schultz becoming standard and recorded by Lothar Zagrosek (Decca). The original orchestration is used in the rival version from Alexander Drčar (Studio Matouš). Pavel Haas's unfinished symphony was orchestrated from sketches by Zdeněk Zouhar and has been recorded by Israel Yinon, a great champion of these composers (Koch Schwann). Gideon Klein's *Partita*, arranged from his string trio by Vojtěch Saudek, has been recorded by Christoph Eschenbach (Ondine). You can read more about these composers [here](#).

### Spain

Albéniz completed his masterpiece, the piano suite *Iberia*, shortly before his death. An orchestral version was begun by Enrique Fernández Arbós, completed by Carlos Surinach and recorded by Jesús López-Cobos (Telarc). Albéniz left two piano works unfinished. One was *Azulejos*, which was completed by Granados and has been recorded by Alicia de Larrocha (EMI) and Miguel Baselga (BIS); the other was *Navarra*, which was intended for *Iberia* but rejected by the composer. Déodat de Séverac supplied a short completion, which is what is usually played. There is also one by Pilar Bayona, recorded by Baselga (BIS) and William Bolcom made a fuller one, using Albéniz's own material. This has been recorded by Marc-André Hamelin (Hyperion).

Granados himself left an unfinished violin sonata at his death. This would have been an impressive work. Two movements are complete and there are the beginnings only of two more. As far as I know, no one has yet attempted to complete the work; what there is has been recorded by members of the Trio Rodin (Aevea).

Falla's *El Amor Brujo* was first performed in 1915 as a work for voice and chamber orchestra, but was unsuccessful in this version. The composer revised the work, reducing its length, scoring it for a standard symphony orchestra and leaving only three vocal numbers. This is the standard version, frequently recorded. The original version was reconstructed by Antonio Gallego in 1986 and has been recorded by Josep Pons (Harmonia Mundi), Angel Gil-Ordóñez (Naxos) and J. F. Heisser (Mirare).

In his later years Falla worked on a large scale work, first envisaged as a cantata, then as an opera, with the title *Atlántida*. He never finished it and after his death Ernesto Halffter undertook to complete it, his version being itself several times revised. There is a recording by Edmon Colomer (Auvidis Valois).

### England

In his last years Elgar worked on several projects which he did not complete. The most important was the third symphony, for which he left many sketches, some of which were published. The estate decided to commission a completion, and this was undertaken by Anthony Payne, who carefully described his work as 'the sketches for symphony no. 3 elaborated by Anthony Payne.' As with the earlier case of Mahler's tenth symphony, this has been treated as a distinction without a difference, and the resulting work has been well accepted. The first recording was by Andrew Davis (NMCD053),

since when there have been several others. There is also, as with Deryck Cooke's work on Mahler, a separate CD in which Payne describes his work (NMCD052), and also a book by him. Payne also completed a sixth *Pomp and Circumstance* march from Elgar's sketches, recorded by Richard Hickox (Chandos) and Tadaaki Otaka (Signum).

Elgar worked on his piano concerto sporadically over many years. He left many sketches and a short score of the slow movement, which was orchestrated by Percy M. Young and recorded by Margaret Fingerhut with Douglas Bostock conducting (Classico CLASS CD 334). Robin Walker realized the sketches to make a complete work, and this has been recorded by David Owen Norris with David Lloyd Jones conducting (Dutton Epoch CDLX7148). The Classico disc also includes the suite Percy Young made from Elgar's sketches for an opera, *The Spanish Lady*.

In recent years a number of early works by Vaughan Williams, which had been suppressed or withdrawn, have been released, some of which have involved completion by other hands. The very early *Fantasy for piano and orchestra* has been recorded by Mark Bebbington with George Vass conducting (Somm). *The Solent, Harnham Down* and *Burley Heath* have been recorded by Paul Daniel (Albion), and the first two by Rumon Gamba (Chandos). Martyn Brabbins has recorded a clutch of unknown Vaughan Williams, realized by contemporary composers, under the title *Discoveries* (Albion). (Albion records is devoted to recording rare and unknown Vaughan Williams.) Otherwise, the conductor Martin Yates and Dutton records have led the way. They have recorded *Heroic Elegy & Triumphal Epilogue*, *Serenade in A minor* and *Bucolic Suite*, which the composer completed but did not publish. On another Dutton disc is *The Blue Bird*, orchestrated by Yates himself along with all three *Norfolk Rhapsodies*. The first has long been familiar, but the second and third were withdrawn and the scores of part of the second and all of the third are missing. Stephen Hogger supplied the missing pages of the second, while David Matthews reconstructed the third from the surviving description of it, retitled as *Norfolk March*.

The *London Symphony* was premiered just before the outbreak of the first World War, and the score was sent to Germany and lost. It was reconstructed from the orchestral parts. It was twice revised, largely by way of cuts, before the first published version of 1920, which was recorded a few times in the days of 78s. It was revised again with further cuts before the final version of 1936. This is the standard version, with many recordings; my favourites are Vernon Handley and Bernard Haitink (both EMI). However, in recent years a recording of 1914 has been made by Richard Hickox (Chandos) and of 1920 by both Martin Yates (Dutton) and Martyn Brabbins (Hyperion). Those who care for the work should hear these.

Yates also orchestrated and recorded the orchestral suite from the opera *Sir John in Love*, titled *Fat Knight*, and made an orchestral version of the brass band overture *Henry V*. Among later works, *Dark Pastoral*, intended as the slow movement of a Cello Concerto, was completed and orchestrated by David Matthews, recorded on another of the Dutton discs.

Vaughan Williams wrote music for eight films, and this has been gathered on a set of three discs under Rumon Gamba (Chandos). However, the most important, that for *Scott of the Antarctic*, is now available in a fuller version from Yates (Dutton). This includes music not only not drawn on for the *Sinfonia Antartica* but also some which was not even used in the film. Vaughan Williams also wrote incidental music for plays, including radio plays. The overture and suite he made of the music for Aristophanes's *The Wasps* are well known, but the complete score has been edited by Igor Kennaway



and David Pountney and recorded by Mark Elder (Hallé). Some of his other incidental music has been recovered, such as that for three plays by Euripides by Alan Tongue (Albion) and for Shakespeare's *Richard II*, which was never used, recorded by Yates (Dutton).

Vaughan Williams's intended *magnum opus*, the opera *Pilgrim's Progress*, had a long and complicated gestation. The first part to be completed, *The Shepherds of the Delectable Mountains*, of 1922, recorded by Matthew Best (Hyperion), became the penultimate scene of the opera. In 1943 there was a broadcast using music the composer had drafted for the opera. The original broadcast has been issued (Albion) and an adaptation by Christopher Palmer has been recorded also by Best with the title *The Pilgrim's Progress: A Bunyan Sequence* (Hyperion). Vaughan Williams also drew on some of its themes in his fifth symphony, of 1943, thinking he might never complete the opera. However, it finally appeared in 1951; there are three recordings: Adrian Boult (EMI), Igor Kennaway (RNCM PP1-2 DDD) and Richard Hickox (Chandos).

Both Holst and Bridge planned symphonies which they were not able to complete. Holst left only a *Scherzo*, recorded by Adrian Boult (Lyrita) and Andrew Davis (Chandos) and Bridge only an *Allegro moderato*, which was realized by Colin Matthews and recorded by Nicholas Braithwaite (Lyrita) and Richard Hickox (Chandos).

John Ireland wrote music for a film, *The Overlanders*, which, after his death, was made into a suite by Charles Mackerras. Geoffrey Bush arranged *A Downland Suite* and *Julius Caesar* for orchestra from the original brass band versions. They have both been recorded by Adrian Boult (Lyrita). All three have also been recorded by Martin Yates (Dutton), who uses his new orchestration of *A Downland Suite*. Graham Parlett arranged a number of Ireland works for string orchestra, recorded by David Curtis (Naxos)

As well as his canonical seven symphonies and the unnumbered early symphony *Spring Fire*, Arnold Bax completed an even earlier Symphony in F in piano score, but he never orchestrated it. Martin Yates has orchestrated and recorded this (Dutton). Bax's numbered first symphony originated as a piano sonata in E flat, which came between his second and third numbered sonatas, before he realised it would work better as a symphony, for which he wrote a different slow movement. He never published the sonata, which was forgotten until the 1980s and required a fair amount of editorial work. It has now been recorded three times: by John McCabe (Continuum), Michael Endres as part of a complete Bax sonata cycle (Oehms) and Mark Bebbington (Somm).

Bax composed a number of orchestral songs, some of which have been lost. A group of those which survive have been recorded by Martyn Hill (Chandos); this includes *Glamour*, orchestrated by Rodney Newton from the piano score.

Otherwise, the person who has done most to rescue lost or forgotten Bax works is Graham Parlett. He has orchestrated works such as *On the Seashore*, *Red Autumn*, *Nocturne* (all Chandos) and the *Symphonic Serenade* (Dutton), as well as compiling the standard catalogue of Bax's works. With so much of Bax out of print or unpublished there is a real need for a proper complete edition, though I suppose nothing will happen until he is out of copyright.

Arthur Bliss's score for the film *Things to come* has always been highly regarded. Philip Lane reassembled it from various sources, and it is included, with other Bliss film scores, in Rumon Gamba's film music series (Chandos).

Ernest Moeran's G minor symphony is well-known. He left sketches for a second symphony, which, following a pattern which is now becoming familiar, Martin Yates has used for what he describes as *Sketches for Symphony No. 2 in E flat realised and completed by Martin Yates* (Dutton). This also contains Moeran's *Overture for a Festival*, orchestrated by Yates from the piano score (and also an orchestration of Ireland's piano suite *Sarnia*).

Walton wrote music for over a dozen films, but arranged little of his work in this form into concert suites. Walton himself, Carl Davis and Charles Groves all recorded some of it (all EMI). However, the most comprehensive collection was made after Walton's death by Christopher Palmer and recorded by Neville Marriner in four discs (Chandos). Palmer also arranged a Symphonic Suite from Walton's opera *Troilus and Cressida*. This has been recorded by Bryden Thomson (Chandos) and a new version is due from Mirga Gražinytė-Tyla (DG). Walton eventually abandoned work on his projected third symphony.

Constant Lambert was already suffering from his final illness when trying to complete his last work, the ballet *Tiresias*. He had to enlist the help of a number of fellow composers to carry out the orchestration under his direction. It has been recorded by David Lloyd-Jones (Hyperion).

Tippett withdrew his early works, and mostly they have not yet surfaced. One which has is his pre-war Symphony in B flat, which preceded his official first symphony. This has received its first recording as part of Martyn Brabbins' complete Tippett symphony cycle (Hyperion).

Britten either did not publish or withdrew a number of his early works, which did surface after his death. These include the *Quatre Chansons Françaises*, recorded by Felicity Lott (Collins and Chandos), *Two Portraits*, recorded by Kent Nagano (Warner) and Edward Gardner (Chandos), the *Double Concerto*, recorded by Nagano (Warner) and Ilan Volkov (Hyperion), *Young Apollo*, recorded by Nagano (Warner) and Volkov (Hyperion) and his first opera, *Paul Bunyan*, recorded by Richard Hickox (Chandos) and Philip Brunelle (Virgin). There is also a composite work assembled by Colin Matthews from sketches made for Benny Goodman and some other works and titled *Movements for a Clarinet Concerto*, which has twice been recorded by Michael Collins (NMC and Chandos).

### United States

Charles Ives published few of his works and was a compulsive reviser, so the issue for him is one of editing rather than of reconstruction. An exception to this is his *Universe Symphony*, which he projected and sketched but never completed. There have been two completions. That by Larry Austin uses Ives's ideas but also a good deal of his own material (Centaur). The more recent one by Johnny Reinhardt (Stereo Society) uses only Ives's own material but has a relatively small group of 19 musicians play some 120 lines, with plentiful use of overdubbing. Reinhardt also has written a book about how he set about the task. This is probably the closest we are going to get to Ives's concept.

I should also mention here the orchestration of Ives's *Concord Sonata* by Henry Brant as *A Concord Symphony*, which has been twice recorded, by Dennis Russell Davies (Innova) and Michael Tilson Thomas (SFS Media). I find this very successful.

Carl Ruggles wrote little, but of high quality, recorded complete by Michael Tilson Thomas (Other Minds). He destroyed many of his sketches but a large number remained. After Ruggles's death John Kirkpatrick, also known for his work on Ives, assembled some of these into four piano works and one for violin and piano. They have been recorded by Donald Berman on a disc titled *The Uncovered Ruggles* (New World Records). Ruggles also destroyed the draft of his opera, *The Sunken Bell*, which he had submitted to the Metropolitan opera; Robert Young McMahan was at one time working on a reconstruction but this has not appeared.

Aaron Copland left his last work on his music desk. He gave Bennett Lerner permission to turn it into a short piano piece, titled *Proclamation*, recorded by Leo Smit (Sony) and Ramon Salvatore (Cedille) and he also authorised Philip Ramey to orchestrate it. This has not yet been commercially recorded but you can hear it [here](#).

### Conclusion

I am not suggesting that all these completions and reconstructions are equally successful and worthwhile. One test of success is acceptance into the general repertoire, and, leaving out revisions, orchestrations and transcriptions, here are some obvious examples: Bach concertos, Gluck's *Orfeo* in versions based on Berlioz' edition, Mozart's clarinet concerto with basset clarinet and his *Requiem* (various versions), Beethoven's *Leonore*, Bruckner's eighth symphony (Haas edition), Mahler's tenth symphony (Cooke edition), Faure's *Requiem* (1893 reconstruction), Russian operas notably *Prince Igor* and *Khovanshchina*, Elgar's third symphony, Bartók's third piano concerto, Schoenberg's *Jakobsleiter*, Berg's *Lulu*.

There are others which seem to me equally worthy of acceptance but which currently have only marginal or fringe status. Some of these are: reconstructed Renaissance church music, Mozart's C minor Mass (Levin edition), Schubert symphonies and piano sonatas, Bruckner's ninth symphony (Gerd Schaller revised version), Debussy's *Printemps* (de Cou choral version), Stravinsky's *Les Noces* (1917 version), Grieg's second string quartet (Röntgen version), the Tchaikovsky-Bogatyrev symphony in E flat, Aarre Merikanto's *Symphonic Study*, Janáček's *Glagolitic Mass* (Wingfield version), various works by Enescu, the septet version of Richard Strauss's *Metamorphosen*, various works by Kurt Weill and the Terezin composers. There are also successful shorter works such as Bach's final fugue from *The Art of Fugue* (Tovey completion, together with his suggestions for performance), Mozart's *Concert Rondo* K.386, the Sinon scene from Berlioz' *Les Troyens*, the *Tristan* Prelude with the concert ending, Beaumont's completion of Busoni's *Dr Faust*, Prokofiev's *Cello concertino* (Blok version) and various piano pieces by Liszt and others.

There are also some I regard as failures: Mozart's *Sinfonia Concertante for four wind instruments* even in the Levin version, the Scriabin-Nemtin *Prefatory Action*, Schoenberg's reworkings of Monn and Handel, the vocal version of Berg's *Lyric Suite*, Bartók's viola concerto, Falla's *Atlantida*. This does not mean that I think that these attempts were not worth making or the works not worth hearing, but simply that I do not regard them as artistic successes.

I consider that we owe a good deal to those scholars and others who have made many works performable which previously were not, or made versions which were more complete and satisfactory than those we had before, and that this continues to be a very worthwhile field to explore.

Stephen Barber, February 2020