The Trio in G Minor for Clarinet, Bassoon and Piano by William Yeates Hurlstone

a Critical Reassessment

-

13th May 2004 1st revision 9th July 2004 2nd revision 29th September 2004 3rd revision 21st October 2004 4th revision 21st January 2005 5th revision 25th February 2005 6th revision 23rd November 2006

-

Richard J Moore richardj_moore@uk.ibm.com

364 Catherington Lane
Waterlooville
HANTS
PO8 0TU
UK

Richard J Moore Copyright © 2004

Introduction

The *Trio in G Minor* by William Hurlstone is one of only a handful of works written for clarinet, bassoon and piano; as such, it will be of interest to clarinettists and bassoonists alike. This attractive piece, written in the late 19th century, provides a valuable addition to the repertoire. It has both audience and player appeal; however, from a performer's perspective it is a frustrating work to prepare. The parts and score of the only publicly available source abound with inconsistencies. Even with the latest Emerson edition, while matters of inconsistency have been addressed, it is still difficult to decipher exactly the intent of the composer; the gratuitous overuse of expression marks is particularly troublesome. In comparison, Hurlstone's *Four Characteristic Pieces for Clarinet and Piano* and his *Sonata for Bassoon and Piano* are both finely crafted works. It is therefore a mystery as to why the *Trio* should be so uncharacteristic of Hurlstone's usual attention to detail.

The first printed (Emerson) edition¹ of the *Trio* was based on the only publicly accessible source: a professional copy of the autograph made during the 1930s. This source suffers not only from having had alterations made by Parr², but in its original form it was hardly a faithful reproduction of the autograph. Among the faults that could be readily detected (but not necessarily easily corrected) were inconsistent markings of expression and incorrect harmony. It became apparent that a revision of the printed edition was necessary. Emerson appointed an external editor to undertake this task. This resulted in the publishing of the second edition³ of the *Trio*, where all readily detectable faults were addressed. Independently of this, the author had already embarked upon a detailed study of the autograph manuscript (which is in private hands⁴). From this privileged position it has been possible to gain an insight into the composer's compositional process. Moreover, it has also been possible to determine the extent to which the 1930s copy of the *Trio* (and thus both of the Emerson editions) had diverged from the autograph. To aid the conscientious performer, the author has now prepared a set of some 450 corrigenda and observations⁵. These should be collated with Emerson's second edition to produce the correct *Urtext*.

In the course of researching this work, two significant and related discoveries have been made:

- 1. a *Scherzo* third movement had been omitted from both published editions as well as from the professional copy commissioned in the 1930s;
- 2. the order of the first and last movements had been reversed in both published and professional copies.

With the *Scherzo* restored, the first and last movements interchanged, numerous corrections applied, and erroneous annotations removed, the *Trio in G Minor* has become a rather more substantial work and one worthy of serious attention.

In this article I shall discuss evidence that the *Scherzo* belongs to the *Trio in G Minor* and that its removal and the subsequent exchanging of the outer movements were neither of the composer's intent nor justified. New information relating to Hurlstone's activities as performer and composer has surfaced; this is also presented here. It had been long understood that the *Trio* received its première in 1901⁶ and indeed dated form that time. However, by making a comparative study of Hurlstone's handwriting and manuscripts it has been possible to date the *Trio in G Minor* as being composed around 1896/97 and to conclude that it had probably never received a public performance during Hurlstone's lifetime.

Biography

To understand the circumstances surrounding the composition of the *Trio*, it is necessary to examine details of Hurlstone's career. In particular his interest in wind instruments, both as performer and composer, are discussed.

The Early Years

William Martin Yeates Hurlstone was born on the 7th January 1876 at Richmond Gardens (now Empress Place), Fulham, London, into a well-to-do middle-class family. He was the eldest of four siblings – Florence, Lucy and Katharine being his younger sisters. His grandfather, Frederick Yeates Hurlstone (1800-69), was an artist of some distinction, who had held the first presidency of the Royal Society of British Arts. William's father, Martin de Galway Hurlstone, was a surgeon by profession and held a keen interest in music and the arts. Hurlstone's musical talents revealed themselves from a very early age. He would organise home concerts in which he and his sisters would play his compositions. Hurlstone received piano lessons but was self-taught in composition⁷. He also played the clarinet and had a fondness for wind instruments⁸. His father arranged for the publication of the Five Easy Waltzes for Piano when William was just nine years old. Other juvenile works9 were to be published before Hurlstone received any formal tuition in composition, which he later gained at the Royal College of Music (RCM). Two months before entering the RCM, Hurlstone completed the first of his two works for clarinet, bassoon and piano – The Variations in G Minor dated 19th February 1894. This work, though a product of an untutored composer, shows remarkable inventiveness: of particular note is the variation in 5/8 time in which the melody is set against a duplet cross-rhythm. These *Variations* were to feature again in Hurlstone's developments as a composer when he reused the theme in his Variations for Orchestra on an Original Theme (13th June 1896).

College Years

Hurlstone entered the Royal College of Music in April 1894 with a three-year scholarship to study composition and piano (second study). During his time there, he received many commendations including the award of £6:10s for the Dove Prize. His principal tutors were:

Algernon Ashton – piano Edward Dannreuther – piano (Sir) Frederick Bridge – composition James Higgs – composition Wilfred Paris – composition Sir Charles Stanford – composition

In later years Sir Charles Stanford was to recall that Hurlstone was the most brilliantly gifted of his students. ¹⁰ It is interesting to consider this remark knowing that among Hurlstone's contemporaries at the RCM were:

Thomas Dunhill – composition 1893 John Ireland – piano 1893-1897; composition 1897-1901 Haydn Wood – composition 1897 Samuel Coleridge-Taylor – violin 1890; composition 1893 Ralph Vaughan-Williams – composition 1890-92, 1895-1896 Gustav Holst – composition 1893 Fritz Hart – composition 1893

Such was Hurlstone's promise that the RCM granted him an additional scholarship year.

While he was enjoying considerable success with his college studies his personal circumstances

were somewhat less fortunate. His father, some years earlier, had contracted smallpox while pursuing his medical studies at the Middlesex Hospital, London¹¹. This resulted in his almost total blindness, which forced him to give up surgery. The family had been plunged into financial difficulties, which were made worse by Martin Hurlstone's failed investments. In 1896 Hurlstone's father died of Bright's disease;¹² had it not been for the generosity of the close family friend, Captain Alex S. Beaumont¹³ the surviving family would have been cast into penury. Beaumont was to continue to be a major benefactor and influence throughout Hurlstone's life. He was an amateur violinist and composer to whom Hurlstone dedicated a number of compositions, including his finest and last complete orchestral work, the *Fantasie Variations on a Swedish Air*. It was not only Hurlstone's family misfortunes that beset him: he had been a sickly child suffering from bronchial asthma, which was now taking its toll on his strength. Because of this, Hurlstone had to forego a career as a concert pianist. Nevertheless, his newly completed *Piano Concerto in D Major* received its première at St. James' Hall in 1896 with Hurlstone as soloist accompanied by the RCM Orchestra.

During his remaining years at the RCM Hurlstone was to compose only two more works for full orchestra – *The Magic Mirror Suite* (1896) and the *Variations on a Hungarian Air* (24th May 1897) – before returning to his first love, that of chamber music. On the 30th June 1897 his *Quintet in G Minor for Piano and Wind* received its first performance at an RCM College Concert¹⁴. The players were fellow students and included Eli Hudson (flautist) with whom Hurlstone was to perform regularly in his later professional life. Most of his remaining chamber compositions comprised accompanied songs and melodramas, a form now in disuse where the vocal part would be a spoken recitation of a piece of poetry with musical accompaniment usually provided (in his case) by violin and piano.

Professional Years

On leaving college, at Easter of 1898, Hurlstone sought employment from piano teaching and choral conducting. From the onset of his family's misfortunes, he and his family had moved back to London and settled in South Norwood, near Croydon. Hurlstone remained associated with the Croydon district for the rest of his life¹⁵ and took what opportunities he could to involve himself with local music making. Of particular note was his partnership with C. W. Nightingale¹⁶ (oboist); together they inaugurated the Century Concerts in 1900¹⁷ – Hurlstone taking charge of artistic matters and Nightingale that of administration. The Century Concerts were:

"Established for the Performance of High-Class Vocal and Instrumental Music, and especially Wind Chamber Works. ... A feature of the Concerts will be the performance of Solos on the Flute, Oboe, Clarinet, Bassoon, and Horn, and also on the following instruments, of which the beautiful and distinctive tones are but little known: the Tenor and Bass Flutes, the Oboe d'Amore, the Cor Anglais, the Bass Oboe, the Bass Clarinet, the Saxophone, the Corno di Basetto[sic.], etc." 18

Their patrons were drawn from distinguished musicians of the day: Sir Hubert Parry, Sir Charles Stanford, Sir Frederick Bridge, Sir Frederic Cowen, Edward German and Sir Alexander Mackenzie.

Hurlstone's aim was to promote chamber music, in particular that of living British composers. Though his compositions were played at the Century Concerts, the majority of the programming included works by his contemporaries – Gadsby, Cowen, Lloyd, German, Coleridge-Taylor, Cobb, Dunhill etc.. Such was Hurlstone's reputation that he was able to recruit the most talented musicians from his college days. Of particular note were: Eli Hudson, flute; Charles Draper, clarinet; Edward Dubrucq, bassoon; and Bertie Muskett, horn. Each of these became established professional musicians in London – Hudson, principal flute London Symphony Orchestra¹⁹; Dubrucq, principal bassoon London Symphony Orchestra; Muskett, professor of horn Guildhall School of Music. Draper in particular achieved great fame as a player, soloist and teacher²⁰. With C. W. Nightingale,

these five wind players established themselves as the Century Wind Quintet and were frequently augmented by Hurlstone at the piano. As far as is known, they only performed under the auspices of the Century Concerts. A typical and interesting example taken from a concert programme bill advertising performances at the Pembroke Hall²¹, West Croydon, includes the following works:

Lefebvre – Suite Op 57
Barthe – Passacaille and Aubade
Thuille – Sextette Op 6
Mozart – Quintet K452
Dunhill – Quintet
Saint-Saëns – Tarantelle Op 6
Hurlstone – Suite for Clarinet & Piano [Four Characteristics Pieces]
Bach – Sonata for Flute & Piano

This is possibly one of the earliest British performances of the *Quintet* by Lefebvre and *Sextette* by Thuille; unfortunately the programme bill omits the year and lists only March 19th, April 23rd, and May 21st as concert dates.

The Century Concerts, though popular and continuing until Hurlstone's death, were however not a commercial success. Fortunately for Hurlstone, he received three professional appointments from which he was able to derive an income. The first two were inauspicious:

Appointment as Professor of Music at Croydon Conservatoire;

Appointment as Examiner for Royal Academy of Music Associated Boards for the Croydon District.

The third occurred in 1905 more or less co-incident with his taking the £50 first prize from the inaugural Cobbett Chamber Music Composition Competition. He was invited by Sir Hubert Parry to take the post of Professor of Harmony and Counterpoint at the RCM. This was remarkable because of Hurlstone's age – a mere 29 – for it was the norm for professorships to be awarded to men of many years' professional experience.

Tragically, Hurlstone's appointment was to be short-lived: on the 21st May 1906 he caught a chill while waiting at Victoria Station. Nine days later he was dead²². Hurlstone's demise was widely mourned. His funeral took place on Saturday 2nd June at the Mitcham Road Cemetery. Among the mourners were his sisters Florence and Katharine, Sir Hubert Parry, Sir Charles Villiers Stanford, Sir Frederick Bridge and Samuel Coleridge-Taylor. His obituary appeared in the *Musical Times*²³ and the *Norwood News and Penge and Anerley Chronicle*²⁴. In the latter, some 50 column-inches were devoted to Hurlstone, which included a personal tribute from his friend and fellow Croydonian composer Samuel Coleridge-Taylor. Hurlstone's grave is marked by a broken column and bears Schubert's epitaph: "Music hath here entombed rich treasure but still fairer hopes". As a tribute to Hurlstone, the Society of British Composers funded the posthumous publication²⁵ in 1907 of his *Trio in G Major for Violin, Cello and Piano* (1901) and his *Sonata for Bassoon and Piano* (1904). His close friends, Alex Beaumont and Fritz Hart, arranged for the publication of his *Piano Quartet in E Minor*²⁶ (1904) through Curwen in 1906.²⁷

The Legacy Years

Periodically articles on Hurlstone have appeared in both local and national press. His music was promoted by his sister Katharine until her death in 1951. Hurlstone's orchestral compositions were performed regularly by the BBC and Hallé orchestras until Katharine's death. His niece Christine

Waddicor further promoted the name of her uncle by arranging for his *Fantasie Variations on a Swedish Air*, *Piano Concerto in D Major*, *Trio in G Major for Violin*, *Cello and Piano and Piano Quartet in E Minor* to be recorded under the Lyrita label. More recently his *Magic Mirror Suite*, *Variations on an Original Theme* and *Variations on a Hungarian Theme* have appeared on CD, as have several of his chamber works (see Appendix, *Discography* on page 15).

In 1936, Croydon musicologist H. G. Newell produced the biographical pamphlet (27 pages) William Yeates Hurlstone Musician and Man. Katharine Hurlstone expressed her desire for a more comprehensive volume on her brother. In 1947 she edited a booklet, William Hurlstone Musician, in which she expanded Newell's material and combined it with a series of contributions from Hurlstone's friends and contemporaries. One of the more significant contributions was Thomas F. Dunhill's The Music of William Hurlstone – A Critical Appreciation. These two publications form the basis of most of the post-war writing about Hurlstone. It is unfortunate that Katharine Hurlstone's book can be shown to contain a number of inaccuracies, some have found their way into record sleeve-notes and other more recent publications²⁸.

Examination of the Trio

Sources

The available sources for the *Trio* are:

Source (a): Hurlstone's autograph score, movements 1, 2, 4 – William Waterhouse Private Library, Gloucestershire.

Source (b): Hurlstone's autograph score Scherzo movement – RCM, London ms 4537.

Source (c): Professional copy of the piano score movements 1, 2, 4, evidently made from (a) – RCM, London.

Source (d): Copyist's clarinet and bassoon parts movements 1, 2, 4 – Waterhouse Library, Gloucestershire.

Source (e): Copyist's clarinet and bassoon parts movements 1, 2, 4 – RCM, London.

Source (f): Emerson's first edition of the *Trio in G Minor*, 1983

Source (g): Emerson's second edition of the *Trio in G Minor*, 1998 edited by Diana Bickley.

Source (a) is written on 12-stave paper 300mm x 242mm. Each movement is bound into its own fascicle and the three fascicles bound within boards covered with dark green cloth. The front board is inscribed with the title and composer's name, but not in the composer's hand. The inside of the front board gives details of the players from a 1939 performance organised by John Parr. The inside back board has the programme bill for that performance. The pages of each movement are numbered from 1. In addition, pages are also numbered from the beginning to the end of the entire trio, but not in the composer's hand. There are also pencilled page numbers and evidence of numbering alterations. The first page of each movement bears Katharine Hurlstone's name and address, but there is neither signing nor dating by the composer. Arabic numerals 4, 2 and 1 (though

the latter is possibly a comma) appear in blue-black ink, in a style consistent with the composer's hand, at the head of page 1 of each movement (4 first, 1 last). Large blue pencil numerals also appear on the first pages of each of the movements, numbered 1, 2 and 3. Bar numbers are written at the right-hand end of each stave and ringed rehearsal letters appear in red ink. They progress throughout the entire trio. The last movement also has pencilled rehearsal letters starting at A. The music is written in a neat hand using blue-black ink. There are very few alterations. Pencilled dynamics and articulations appear throughout the work; these seem to be in a hand consistent with that of the composer's. Occasionally one comes across a reworking where the penned music is crossed out using pencil and a revised section appears following the deletion. The outmoded abbreviation *cres* for *crescendo* is used consistently in both pen and pencil throughout the work. The composer's characteristic *p* and *f* are markings consistent whether written in pen or pencil; they also agree with those used in other Hurlstone autographs. It is apparent that the manuscript paper has been reused, as pencilled sketches appear upside-down at the back of each fascicle. In general the paper is clean and in good condition however the first page of the last movement shows considerable darkening though exposure to dust, dirt and handling.

Source (b) is written on 12-stave paper 300x242mm. The handwriting style is consistent with Source (a). Most is in blue-black ink with emendations made in pencil. The use of *cres* is consistent throughout. The autograph is neither signed nor dated but is unmistakably in Hurlstone's hand. The head of page 1 bears an Arabic numeral 3 in blue-black ink; underneath and to the left, the word *Trio*. As with Source (a) there are signs of the paper having been previously used for a pencil sketch.

Source (c) is written in a professional musical hand. It is evidently a direct copy of Source (a). However there are numerous mistakes in this copy. In particular: grace notes and *octava* makings are incorrect; there are wrong and omitted notes; some dynamics are omitted and some are misconstrued. The copyist also seemed uncertain whether to accept the pencilled emendations in the autograph.

Source (d) comprises the bassoon and clarinet parts in the same hand as Source (c). They are consistent with Source (c). Ringed rehearsal letters in red ink have been added to the bassoon as have bar numbers and a programme bill from the Parr performance (4th March 1939), which is pasted into the end cover. The front cover of the bassoon part bears the title of the work and the composer's name in Parr's handwriting together with Katharine Hurlstone's name and address in her own hand. The clarinet part is more or less clean except for the occasional ringing of a rehearsal letter. The front cover bears only the hand of Katharine Hurlstone.

Source (e) comprises a duplicate set of parts made by the author of Source (c). Here the clarinet part contains the programme bill from the Parr concert and also the ringed rehearsal letters in red ink. The bassoon part is similarly marked but in addition there are numerous emendations to articulation and accentuation in blue-black ink.

Source (f) is a faithful imprint of Source (c). No editorial alterations have been applied.

Source (g) was commissioned by the publisher to deal with the problems inherent in the Source (f) and therefore Source (c) on which it was based. The musicologist Diana Bickley was appointed to undertake this task. At that time the location of the autograph score was unknown to both the editor and publisher. So, with access only to Source (c), Bickely addressed matters of inconsistency by making parts and score agree. She was not to know that many of the expression marks present in the bassoon part (of Sources (f) and (c)) were inauthentic.

Authorship

It is clear that both Sources (a) and (b) are genuine Hurlstone. The consistency between the pencil and pen markings and between the two sources suggests strongly that the pencil is also Hurlstone's. We are able to perceive his compositional process: first a pencil sketch (perhaps) from the back of the manuscript paper. Then, a near fair copy in ink where all matters of harmony, melody and tempi are settled. Occasionally there is a change of mind, whereupon Hurlstone deletes the penned section, crossing it out in pencil, and proceeds with the revision in pen. The next stage is to add articulation, dynamics and accentuation in pencil. Here Hurlstone affords himself some short cuts: where it is obvious that a similar emendation is to be applied to another part he marks only the first occurrence. The final stage is to make a fair copy of score and parts. On completion he signs and dates the score after or below the last bar.

Sources (c), (d) and (e) are all made by the same copyist. The emendations in coloured ink, blue pencil, rehearsal letters and bar numbers are unmistakably John Parr's. He possessed a large library of chamber music from which it is possible to see the same treatment being applied to works whether in printed or manuscript form. Thus, the emendations in coloured ink and coloured pencil in Source (a) are also due to Parr.

It is possible to say with confidence that the extraneous and exaggerated expression marks that appeared in the bassoon part to Emerson's first edition of the *Trio* can be safely ignored. Had it not been for the faulty copying on the score (Source (c)), the Emerson edition might have been rectifiable directly from the Emerson piano score. However, such are the discrepancies between Sources (a) and (c) that a note by note comparison between Emerson and Source (a) has been necessary to produce a corrected set of parts.

Date of Composition

Graphological analysis suggests the *Trio* cannot have been composed later than 1897. Hurlstone produces a fair copy with parts for most of his compositions, and destroys earlier workings. Those in fair-copy form are dated and signed – usually after or below the final bar. From this it has been possible to correlate handwriting style, clef-style, the use of cursive and Roman letters (A & H in particular), and the size and format of manuscript paper with composition dates. A consistent pattern emerges among his chamber compositions:

• to June 1898: 13 compositions: 12-stave paper 300mm x 242mm

• June 1898: String Quartet in E Minor: 20-stave paper 322mm x 242mm

from July 1899: 14 compositions: 18-stave paper 370mm x 272mm
1906: 2 compositions: 16-stave paper 368mm x 272mm

post 1896: Roman H onlypost 1897: Roman A only

Works prior to June 1898 invariably have decorative scroll-work adorning their title pages. Apart from one work in 1900, Hurlstone dispenses with this frivolity after 1898. Of the 10 undated chamber works, none contradicts this pattern.

Both autograph Sources (a) and (b) exhibit the following graphological characteristics:

• Use of Cursive upper-case letters in *Allegro*, *Bassoon*, *Clarinet* and *Piano*

- Use of 12-stave manuscript paper 300mm x 242mm
- No decorative title page, though this might be a facet of the manuscript not being in fair-copy form
- Notation in a typically tidy hand, however the clefs show signs of being written at speed and are are consistent with those in the *Variations for Orchestra on an Original Theme* (1896)

These considerations lead to the conclusion that the *Trio in G Minor* is likely to have been composed in 1896/97.

The theme used in the *Variations for Orchestra on an Original Theme* (1896) was precisely that used in the earlier *Variations in G Minor for Clarinet, Bassoon and Piano* (1894). Some of the variational thematic material is also shared. It appears that the idea of writing a set of variations, which started as a modest chamber work, eventually manifested itself as a full orchestral work. Though a student work, these orchestral variations exhibit a considerable advancement in maturity of style over the variations for trio. Hurlstone may well have felt motivated to replace the now superseded trio with a more mature work based on new ideas.

During 1896 and 97 Hurlstone expanded his scope to include orchestral compositions. In this period he produced at least three substantial works – *Variations for Orchestra on an Original Theme*, *Variations for Orchestra on a Hungarian Theme*, *Piano Concerto in D Major* – which may may have left him with little time to complete the finishing touches to a work for which there was no imminent performance. Furthermore, his *Quintet in G Minor for Piano and Wind* received its first performance at an RCM Concert on the 30th June 1897. This suggests that he must have been busy with the *Quintet* at the same time as he was drafting the *Trio in G Minor*. It seems likely that he had set aside completion of the trio because of more pressing commitments.

Association of the Scherzo

There are two facts that strongly suggest the *Scherzo* is a movement of the *Trio in G Minor*:

- 1. The presence of the Arabic numerals at the head of each movement. In Source (a): 4, 2 and 1. In Source (b): 3.
- 2. The back of the second movement of Source (a) contains a pencil sketch of the opening of the Scherzo. Hurlstone would have been working on both Sources (a) and (b) contemporaneously.

Furthermore, the Arabic numerals suggest that the conceived order of the movements was with the outer two interchanged. Thus:

Allegro moderato
 Andante
 Scherzo: Allegro con moto – Piu Lento – Allegro con moto
 Andante maestoso – Allegro vivace
 (keys g – G – g)
 (keys Eb – Ab – Eb)
 (keys c – C – c)
 (keys g – G)

In this revised format his use of keys and tempi makes a great deal of sense: to start in the minor and end in the major; and conclude the last movement with the fastest and most triumphal section of the entire *Trio* is highly satisfactory. However, with the outer movements interchanged (4, 2, (3) then 1) the piece now has an unconvincing ending on grounds of tempo and key change; There is little musical sense for the exchange of outer movements, unless the *Scherzo* had indeed become misplaced. Under that circumstance one might just argue that a better contrast in tempi is achieved.

Was the omission of the *Scherzo* accidental or deliberate (given that there are no musical grounds

for doing so)?

There are two possible reasons for deliberate removal:

- 1. A performance was planned but with insufficient time to allow for the complete work to be played;
- 2. A performance was planned where the skill of the pianist was not on a par with Hurlstone's (the *Scherzo* is arguably the hardest movement of the four from the pianist's perspective).

Whilst these are possible, neither argues for permanent exclusion of the *Scherzo*; and with no evidence of a performance²⁹ ever occurring during Hurlstone's lifetime one must conclude that the separation was accidental.

On Hurlstone's death most of his musical effects were retained by his sister Katharine with a few apparently going to his middle sister Lucy. Though we have no direct evidence for this, those scores in Katharine's possession all bear her name and address; while the few manuscripts that were bequeathed to the RCM by Lucy's daughter, Catherine Hurlstone Waddicor, were either unmarked or annotated with only the Waddicor name. Movements 1, 2, and 4 are annotated with Katharine's name and address while the separated 3rd movement possesses no such additions. Given the dirty appearance of the first page of the last movement of Source (a) (the original first movement) one might surmise that the *Trio* had been stored for many years in its complete and original ordering.

Before accepting this conclusion one must explain the binding of Source (a) in cloth-covered boards. Nearly all of Hurlstone's manuscripts are in small fascicles and unbound. The exceptions are:

- · Variations in G Minor for Clarinet, Bassoon and Piano
- Trio in G Minor for Clarinet, Bassoon and Piano
- · Scherzo for Flute, Oboe, Horn and Piano

Each of these is bound in the same cloth boards, each heavily annotated by John Parr, with title page and programme bill additions. The covers are inscibed in Parr's hand. That Katharine adds her name and address to the first page of each of the movements of the *Trio* in *G Minor* suggests each of the constituent fascicles came into her hands as separate entities. A reasonable explanation must be that Parr, who had borrowed the *Trio* from Katharine Hurlstone for some considerable time, had had it bound.

One can be reasonably sure that instrumental parts were never made by Hurlstone because the autograph sources, (a) and (b), are at a compositional stage prior to production of fair copies. Thus, when Katharine had requests for the *Trio* from both John Parr and The Pauline Juler Trio³⁰, she commissioned a copy of the score and two sets of parts to make two performable sets of material.

Concluding Remarks

It is clear that Hurlstone had always intended the *Trio* to be a four-movement work with the outer movements in the order now proposed. Musically, it makes a great deal of sense to incorporate the original scheme. If one has been used to performing the incomplete version then a word of caution is due: one should reassess the entire piece in its revised setting. The approach to the newly positioned first and last movements will need to accommodate the enlarged format. Particular care should be exercised in the choice of tempi. The *Scherzo* has multiple harmonic changes within each bar, which suggests a three-beat measure rather than one for this 3/8 movement – compare this with

the trio sections to Beethoven's *String Quartet Op 59 no1*. The dangers in turning the *Scherzo* into a Mendelssohnian *A Midsummer Night's Dream – Scherzo* are that the harmonic changes will not be heard; and the piece will be concluded by the *Scherzo*, leaving the fourth movement isolated.

There are few references to the *Trio* other than those by Katharine Hurlstone³¹ and Thomas Dunhill³². Two post-war dissertations – Gillerman³³ and Kirby³⁴ – acknowledge the existence of the *Scherzo*. However Gillerman does not discuss the *Trio* and treats the *Scherzo* as an independent work. Kirby discusses both but dismisses the inclusion of the *Scherzo* with the *Trio* on stylistic grounds. He does not consider the effect of exchanging the outer movements, which radically affects one's conception of the entire *Trio* in *G Minor*.

The *Scherzo* is being made generally available by Emerson Edition (E404) as an interim supplement to the *Trio* pending the publication of a major revision that incorporates the corrigenda and missing movement. The *Variations in G Minor for Clarinet, Bassoon and Piano* has been typeset and may be published by Emerson edition at a future date.

Appendices

Acknowledgements

Brown, James: for information relating to C W Nightingale.

Bryant, Michael: for making available the Lyrita recording of the *Trio in G Major* and *Piano Quartet in E Minor*. In addition, for information relating to John Parr.

Catterick, Tony: for supplying information relating to Bertie Muskett.

Davies, Oliver: for his invaluable help in surfacing Hurlstone's archival material and memorabilia from the RCM Department of Portraits.

Emerson, June: for her support for this project and provision of the printed edition of the *Trio* from which to make a set of master corrections.

Foreman, Lewis: for making available his private copies of the Society of British Composers' Yearbooks.

McLauchlin, Jane: for her tireless research among the Croydon archives, on my behalf.

RCM Library Staff for making available copies of Hurlstone manuscripts and archival material. Also for granting permission to publish the *Scherzo* movement of the *Trio*.

Waterhouse, William: for the extended loan of the *Trio in G Minor* autograph and for his invaluable advice, guidance, suggestions and corrections over the preparation of this article and the corrigenda.

Wye, Trevor: for supplying information on Eli Hudson.

Bibliography

• . ,
Akpan, Eloise: "William Hurlstone: South Norwood Composer", Norwood Review, May 2000
Anon.: Hudson, Eli, Who's Who in Music 1913, Pitman, London 1913
—— Hurlstone obituary, Norwood News, 9th June 1906
—— Hurlstone obituary, Musical Times, July 1st 1906
"Composer by-passed by fame", Croydon Advertiser January 9th 1976

Gillerman, Susan Linda: William Yeates Hurlstone: his Life and Chamber Music (diss.) Boston University 1969

Hardy, Lisa: The British Piano Sonata, 1870-1945, The Boydell Press, Woodbridge 2001

Hurlstone, Katharine (ed.): William Hurlstone Musician, Cary, London 1947

Jackson, Kenneth Hurlstone: private letter to the author 1990

Kirby, David S.: *The Chamber Music of William Yeates Hurlstone* (diss.) University of Cincinnati 1995

Linstead, George: "John Parr and his Concerts", Musical Times, June 1945

McVeagh, Diana: "Variations on an Original Theme, The Magic Mirror Suite & Variations on a Hungarian A" (sleeve note SRCD 208), 1993

Nettel, Reginald: "Hurlstone and his work", Musical Times, November 1958

Newell, Henry George.: William Yeates Hurlstone Musician and Man, Chester, London 1936

Pascall/Cobbett: "Hurlstone" New Grove 1, 1980

Pascall/Dibble: "Hurlstone" New Grove 2, 2001

Pope, Michael: "Trio in G Major for Violin, Cello and Piano & Quartet in E minor" (sleeve note for Lyrita SRCS 117),1984

Truscott, Harold: "Piano Concerto & Fantasie Variations on a Swedish Air" (sleeve note for Lyrita SRCS 100), 1979

Waddicor, Mark: private communications with the author, 2002-2004

Weston, Pamela: Clarinet Virtuosi of the Past, Hale, London 1971

—— More Clarinet Virtuosi of the Past, Weston, London 1977

Wheeler, Ray: "William Yeates Hurlstone: The English Schubert 1876-1906", Newsdisc, Croydon 1976

Other source material

Sundry newspaper cuttings relating to Hurlstone: Croydon Public Library Archives

Century Concert Programme Bills 1900-1906: ibid

Programme: Hurlstone Memorial Concert July 1906: ibid

Hurlstone: Autograph mss: RCM Library, London

Hurlstone: Autograph mss: Waterhouse Library, Gloucestershire

Hurlstone: Complete published works: British Library, London

Student Records for Hurlstone, Dubrucq, Muskett, Hudson, Jones, Draper: RCM, London.

Emerson Edition #62: Trio in G Minor for Clarinet, Bassoon & Piano 1\1983

— 2\1998 ed. Diana Bickley

Selected Discography

Trio in G Minor [3 movements]; Sonata for Bassoon and Piano, Four Characteristic Pieces for Clarinet and Piano; Murray Khouri, clarinet; Peter Musson, bassoon; Stephen Emerson, piano – Continuum CCD 1079 - 2001

Trio in G Minor [3 movements]; The English Romantics Trio-Clarinet Classics CC 0023 - 1998

Trio in G Minor [complete]; Variations in G Minor for clarinet, bassoon and piano; The Glinka Trio-Hungaraton (unissued) - 2002

Variations on an Original Theme; The Magic Mirror Suite; Variations on a Hungarian Air; Braithwaite, London Philharmonic Orchestra – Lyrita SRCD 208 - 1993

Piano Concerto; Fantasie Variations on a Swedish Air; Braithwaite, London Philharmonic Orchestra – Lyrita SRCS 100 - 1979

Trio in G Major for Violin, Cello and Piano; Quartet in E minor; The Tunnell Piano Quartet in E Minor – Lyrita SRCS 117 – 1984

Cello Sonata in D et al; Andrew Fuller, cello; Michael Dussek, piano – Dutton CDLX 7102 - 1999

Hurlstone's Original Works for Wind Instruments³⁵

Variations in G Minor for Clarinet, Bassoon and Piano

Completed 19th February 1894. Unpublished, in preparation (Moore). Nothing known of the dedication or première. The theme was later reused for the orchestral *Variations on an Original Theme*.

Trio in G Minor for Clarinet, Bassoon, and Piano

Completed ca. 1896/7. Published by Emerson 1983. First performance on the incomplete version assumed to have occurred in the 1930s. First complete performance by the Glinka Trio, Budapest, 2003. Dedication unknown.

Ouintet in G Minor for Piano, Oboe, Clarinet, Horn and Bassoon

Completed ca. 1897. Published by Emerson 1998. premièred at the RCM College Chamber Music Concert No 247 30th June 1897; players: William Hurlstone – piano; Eli Hudson – flute; Frederick Moss – clarinet; Herbert Thornton – horn; Edwin Cox – bassoon. Dedication unknown. Second movement later incorporated into the second movement of the *Quintet for Violin, Viola, Cello and Piano in e.*

Four Characteristic Pieces for Clarinet and Piano

(originally called *Suite for Clarinet and Piano*)

Movements 1-4 completed: 8^{th} September 1899, 2^{nd} August 1899, 9^{th} , 4^{th} September 1899, 9^{th} October 1899. Dedicated to George Clinton, Published by Avison 1909; re-issued by Emerson 1978. premièred at the George Clinton Chamber concerts 1900 by Clinton and Hurlstone; reviewed in the Musical Times May 1^{st} 1900. Fourth movement later arranged for the *Scherzo for Flute*, *Oboe, Horn and Piano* q.v.

Scherzo for Flute, Oboe, Horn and Piano

Completed 6th April 1900. Based on the 4th movement of the Four Characteristic Pieces for Clarinet and Piano. A performance at the Century Concerts 1900 is known, Probably premièred at the Century Concerts and probably dedicated to the Century Wind Quintet. Unpublished, in preparation (Moore).

Sonata for Bassoon and Piano

Completed July 1904. Dedicated to Edward Dubrucq. Published by Avison 1907; re-issued by Emerson 1976. Known to have been performed at the Century Concerts, probably premièred there as well.

Biographical Time-line

Diog	rapinear rime inte
1876	Born 7th January, Richmond Gardens (now Empress Place), Fulham, London
1883	Age 7 composing and playing, living at Hastings moved to Wilton near Salisbury. Choirboy at Bemerton Parish Church. principal instrument piano, for which he received tuition.
1884	Age 8 brought to the notice of Parry & Grove who attested to his remarkable aural ability
1885	Age 9 Five Easy Waltzes for piano published by his father
1886	Age 10 Honours Certificate for Junior Division of Trinity College local centre exams.
	Martin Hurlstone's declining fortunes force a move to London
1891	Age 15 Trio Violin, Cello, Piano Op. 2 published with Lafleur by his father.
	Hurlstone's heath dogged by bronchial asthma.
	Studies piano under Wilmot in Croydon
1894	19 th February: <i>Variations in G Minor for Clarinet, Bassoon and Piano</i> (unpublished). Noteworthy for its inspired 5/8 variation.
	April: enters RCM under three-year Scholarship, which is later extended to a fourth year. First study: composition. Second study: piano. Living in Croydon.
	April: Piano Duet (unpublished).
	July: Piano Sonata in f (unpublished).
1895	Five Dances for Orchestra (unpublished).
	22 nd September: A Two-act Opera (unpublished).

1896	13th June: Variations for Orchestra on an Original Theme (unpublished).
	Piano Concerto performed by Composer at St. James' Hall with the RCM Orchestra.
	Father dies of Bright's disease before RCM studies concluded. Benefactor Captain Beaumont aids the family financially.
1897	24th May: Hungarian Air with Variations for Piano (unpublished).
	30 th June: première of the <i>Quintet in G Minor for Piano and Wind</i> at the RCM College Concerts.
	Première of the Violin Sonata in D minor. RCM, Willie Read violin, Hurlstone piano.
	23 rd November: <i>Violin Sonata in D minor</i> performed at the British Chamber Music Concerts, Jasper Sutcliffe violin, Ernest Fowles piano. Critique, Musical Times 1 st January 1898 (p27).
1898	Exits RCM
	June: <i>String Quartet in E Minor</i> (published 2005 Merton Music). Dedicated to Ernest Fowles.
	30 th November: première or <i>String Quartet in E minor</i> at the British Chamber Music Concerts. Critique, Musical Times 1 st January 1899 (p26).
1899	September/October: Suite for Clarinet and Piano (later published under the title: Four Characteristic Pieces for Clarinet and Piano)
	5 th December: première of the <i>Cello Sonata in D minor</i> given at the Queen's (Small) Hall under the auspices of the British Chamber Music Concerts, Herbert Walenn cello, Ethel Bower piano. Critique, Musical Times 1 st January 1900 (p41)
1900-0	06 Hurlstone derives income from composing, teaching, conducting local choral societies and performing. Performances are limited to accompanying and chamber music because of his health.
	Appointed Professor of Music at Croydon Conservatoire
	Appointed Examiner for RAM Associated Boards for the Croydon District.
1900	Suite for Clarinet and Piano premièred at the George Clinton Chamber Concerts. Clinton & Hurlstone performers ³⁶ .
	Inception of the Century Chamber Concerts organised by C W Nightingale (oboist) and
	Hurlstone. Patrons: Stanford, Parry, Stanley. Based in Croydon, performing frequently at the Stanley Halls and the Public Halls Croydon, but also at other venues in the London district.
1901	Scherzo for Piano and Wind (unpublished) for the Century Concerts.
	19th June: Alfred the Great ballade for chorus and orchestra.
	30th September: Trio in G Major Major for Piano, Violin & Cello.
	Cello Sonata published. Dedicated to May Muckle. Performed at the Century Concerts ³⁷ .
1903	August. Fantasie Variations on a Swedish Air completed.
1904	première of the <i>Magic Mirror Suite</i> incidental Music to the Ballet for Snow White and the Seven Dwarfs.
	20 th May: première of the <i>Fantasie Variations on a Swedish Air</i> . Arguably the most mature of all his orchestral compositions and has enjoyed many performances in the decades following the composer's death. The publication of this work was funded from a donation of £20,000 made by Lord Ernest Palmer to the RCM to be used for assisting young musicians.

	July: <i>Sonata for Bassoon and Piano</i> . Dedicated to Eduard Dubrucq, friend and bassoonist in the Century Wind Quintet. It is subsequently preformed at the Century Concerts ³⁸ .
	6 th December: première of <i>Piano Quartet in E Minor for Piano, Violin, Viola and Cello</i> at the Æeolian Hall.
1905	Society of British Composers inaugurated, Hurlstone a founder member.
	Phantasie String Quartet composed for submission to the first Cobbett Chamber Music Competition.
	September: appointed by Sir Hubert Parry as Professor of Harmony and Counterpoint at the RCM.
1906	LSO performs the Fantasie Variations on a Swedish Air.
	Cobbett Competition first prize of £50 awarded for the Phantasie String Quartet.
	20th March: song - The Blind Boy. Last completed composition.
	21st May: caught a chill, which proved to be fatal, while waiting at Victoria Station.
	30 th May: died. His latest composition, a symphonic poem, remained incomplete and in a fragmentary form.
	2 nd June ³⁹ : buried, Mitcham Cemetery, Croydon.
	9 nd June. Obituary in the <i>Norwood News and Penge and Anerley Chronicle</i> . Tributes by Samuel Collerige-Taylor, Captain Alex S. Beaumont and Ernest Halsey
	22 nd June: première of the <i>Phantasie Quartet in A</i> , performed by the Saunders Quartet. (Musical Times 1 st July 1906 p489)
	1st July: obituary in the Musical Times.
	Society of British Composers agree to fund the posthumous publication of several of Hurstone's works under the auspices of Avison Edition.
1907	Society of British Composers' Yearbook 1906/7 publishes a partial catalogue of Hurlstone's works.
	Sonata for Bassoon and Piano published by Avison ed.
1908	Society of British Composers' Yearbook 1907/8 publishes a fuller catalogue of Hurlstone's works.
1909	Four Characteristic Pieces for Clarinet and Piano published by Avison ed.
1912	Society of British Composers' Yearbook 1912 republishes a catalogue of Hurlstone's works.
1913	Chamber Music. A Treatise for Students by Thomas Dunhill published. Hurlstone's Sonata for Bassoon and Piano is discussed.
1936	William Yeates Hurlstone Musician and Man, by Henry Newell is published by Chester, 32 pages. This is the first biography to appear in print.
1936	£50 anonymous donation presented to the Royal College of Music for the creation of the "Hurlstone Memorial Prize" in which a performance of a Hurlstone composition is judged. The income form the anonymous gift was doubled by the RCM.
1944	Further anonymous donation of £200 to the "Hurlstone Memorial Prize".
1947	William Hurlstone Musician, edited by Katharine Hurlstone is published by Cary, 118 pages. This is an expansion of Newell together with a collection of reminiscences from Hurlstone's contemporaries.
	Katharine Hurlstone (pg 64) writes that the piano concerto " is now being revived by Mr. Patrick Piggott". This resulted in a private recording.

- 1958 November: Hurlstone and his work by Reginald Nettel is published in the Musical Times
- 1969 *William Yeates Hurlstone: his Life and Chamber Music*, dissertation by Susan Gillerman, 206 pages.
- 1995 The Chamber Music of William Yeates Hurlstone, thesis by David S. Kirby, 131 pages.
- 1976 Centenary Exhibition organised by Christine Waddicor, the composer's niece, at the library of the University of Exeter.
- 1979 The first of a series of recordings issued by Richard Itter under his Lyrita record label is released.
- 1983 Trio in G Minor for Clarinet, Bassoon and Piano published by Emerson.
- 1998 *Quintet in G Minor for Flute, Oboe, Clarinet, Horn and Bassoon* published by Emerson.
- 2002 Première of the complete *Trio in G Minor* in Hungary by the Glinka Trio.
- January: first British performance of the complete *Trio in G Minor* by Robert Blanken, Richard Moore and Karen Kingsley at the Tudor Merchants' Hall, Southampton.
- —— September 29th: *Scherzo* movement from the *Trio in G Minor* is broadcast on BBC Radio 3 by The English Romantics Trio.
- —— 30th September: *Trio in G Minor* complete performance at the Purcell Room by The English Romantics Trio.
- 2006 30th May. Centenary anniversary performance of the Piano Quartet in E Minor by the Primrose Quartet at the Wigmore Hall.
- 2006 22nd November: Centenary celebration concert and exhibition at the Royal College of Music. Works performed:
 - "Phantasie String Quartet" the Jenson Quartet
 - "I fear thy kisses, gentle maiden" Lukasz Jacobcvyz, Sebastian Wybrew (pf)
 - "Thou hast left me for ever, Jamie"
 - "That time is dead for ever"
 - "My true love hath my heart" Elenor Dennis, John Cuthbert (pf)

Trio in G minor for Clarinet, Bassoon & Piano -

Janet Hilton (cl), Julie Price (bn), Andrew Ball(pf)

- "Four Characteristic Pieces" Colin Lawson (RCM Director) (cl), Andrew Ball (pf)
- "String Quartet in E minor" the Alea String Quartet

- [1] Emerson edition no. 62 ©1983
- [2] John Parr (1869-1962), Sheffield bassoonist. Organised throughout the Monthly Chamber Concerts at the Victoria Hall, Sheffield 1930-1957. He is responsible for having discovered much unusual and unpublished wind repertoire. A large proportion of his personal library now resides at the British Library.
- [3] Emerson second edition no. 62 ©1998, ed. Diana Bickley.
- [4] Waterhouse private library, Gloucestershire.
- [5] Corrigenda to the *Trio in G Minor* is available from the author.
- [6] K. Hurlstone, p 58 confuses the *Trio in G Minor* with the *Four Characteristic Pieces for Clarinet and Piano* where she incorrectly cites the 1900 Clinton concert as the Trio's première.
- [7] K. Hurlstone p14: Hurlstone was self-taught in composition right up to the point where he was awarded an RCM scholarship.
- [8] K Hurlstone p64: "The Music of William Hurlstone" by Th. Dunhill.
- [9] Two Trios Op2 for Violin, Cello and Piano, Lafleur & Son 1888.
- [10] K. Hurlstone, p. 38.
- [11] K. Hurlstone p. 11 and Newell p. 6.
- [12] Bright's Disease is a necrosis of the kidneys with no known cause nor cure.
- [13] Captain Alexander S. Beaumont (1848-1913), patron of the arts, composer and publisher under the pseudonym of Charles Woolhouse.
- [14] RCM archives held by the Department of Portraits. College Concert No 247, 30th June 1897: William Hurlstone piano; Eli Hudson flute; Frederick Moss clarinet; Herbert Thornton horn; Edwin Cox bassoon.
- [15] For reasons of failing health Hurlstone moved to Battersea in 1906 to be nearer to his work. However he remained strongly associated with Croydon musical life. His family continued to be resident in that district.
- [16] C. W. Nightingale: composer, musical director and self-taught oboist; born 1868, Horsham. Nightingale is credited with having conceived the Century Concerts. See entry in *Who's Who in Music 1913*.
- [17] Newell p. 15
- [18] From the rubric printed on the programme bills for the Century Concerts.
- [19] Fairley p. 68.
- [20] Weston: Clarinet Virtuosi of the Past pp. 264-272 et al.
- [21] Archives of the London Borough of Croydon Local Studies Library 5 programme bills for the Century Concerts.
- [22] Newell p. 20.
- [23] Musical Times July 1st 1906.
- [24] Norwood News and Penge and Anerley Chronicle June 9th 1906.
- [25] Charles Avison Edition was the publishing outlet for the Society of British Composers (1905-1918). Under this edition several of Hurlstone's works were published (and distributed by Novello). On demise of the Society, Avison Ed. was transferred to Cary and later absorbed into Novello.
- [26] Published as Opus 43. However, apart from a very few items of juvenilia, Hurlstone did not use opus numbers. The Op 43 has probably been appended posthumously.
- [27] K. Hurlstone p. 32 states that the *Piano Quartet in E Minor* was published by the Society of British Composers, however the Curwen edition of 1906 cites Beaumont and Hart as the parties responsible. See also endnote 25.
- [28] The date of composition of the *Trio in G Major for Violin, Cello and Piano* has long held to have been written around 1904. However examination of the autograph shows this to have been completed 30th September 1901.
- [29] K. Hurlstone p. 58 See endnote also 6.
- [30] K. Hurlstone p. 58. The Pauline Juler Trio flourished in the 1930s.
- [31] K. Hurlstone p. 58.
- [32] K. Hurlstone p. 64.
- [33] Gillerman p. 178.
- [34] Kirby p. 37.
- [35] A *Clarinet Sonata* is referred in the literature; this sometimes refers to a publisher's arrangement of Hurlstone's *Cello Sonata in D.* At other times it is synonymous with the *Four Characteristic Pieces for Clarinet and Piano*.
- [36] Musical Times May 1st 1900 p 331.
- [37] K. Hurlstone p. 22.
- [38] K. Hurlstone p. 22.
- [39] K. Hurlstone p. 27 erroneously cites the date as Saturday June 1st 1906. Saturday fell on June 2nd which agrees with the obituary published a week later in the *Norwood News* see also endnote 24.
- [40] K. Hurlstone p. 7.